

## فاعلية أسلوب التتمة في تحديد مستوى الفهم القرأني ومدى التقدم في القراءة ضمناً لدى الطلاب المعلمين

د. / بهاء الدين السيد النجار  
أستاذ مساعد بكلية التربية - جامعة الزقازيق

تهدف هذه الدراسة الى الكشف عن مدى صلاحية استخدام اختبارات التتمة في تحديد مستوى الفهم القرأني لدى الطلاب المعلمين ومدى تقدمهم الضمني في القراءة . وقد تكونت عينة الدراسة من كل طلاب قسم اللغة الإنجليزية بكلية التربية - جامعة الزقازيق في السنوات الأربع . وقد صم الباحث خمس أدوات لدراسة فروض الدراسة وجمعت هذه الأدوات في شكل ثلاث مجموعات اثنتان منها تشكل اختبارا للتتمة وأداتان أخريان كونتا اختبارا للفهم القرأني ومقياسا للتقدير الذاتي في القراءة .

ولما كان الفهم القرأني يرتبط بالتقدم في القراءة الذي يرتبط بدوره بتفضيلات الطلاب فكان لابد من الكشف عن المجالات التي يفضل الطلاب القراءة فيها ، الأمر الذي حفز الباحث للكشف عن المجالات التي يفضل الذكور القراءة فيها وهل تختلف عن مجالات الإناث .

### وقد اشتملت الدراسة على ستة فروض هي :

- ١- هناك فروق دالة بين درجات الطلاب في مرحلتى الاختبار القبلى والبعدى في الفهم القرأني في اختبارات التتمة وفي الاختبارات التقليدية .
  - ٢- هناك ارتباط دال بين درجات الطلاب في اختبارات التتمة والاختبارات التقليدية .
  - ٣- من ( ١ ، ٢ ) يعد استخدام اختبارات التتمة وسيلة صالحة لتحديد مستوى الفهم القرأني لدى الطلاب المعلمين ومدى تقدمهم في القراءة ضمناً .
  - ٤- هناك فروقا دالة بين الجنسين في التحسن في الأداء لدى الطلاب .
  - ٥- سوف يقدر الطلاب أنفسهم كقراء جيدين في مقياس التقدير الذاتي في القراءة .
- وقد ثبت صحة الفروض فيما عدا الفرض الرابع . وقد تمت معالجة البيانات والوصول الى نتائج الدراسة والتوصيات وكذلك اقتراحات لدراسات مستقبلية .

15. **Richardson, Donald, C. (1980):** Cloze procedure. Bismark, N.D.: International Reading Association. ERIC. ED. 197 298, Cited in Bastidas (Op Cit.).
16. **Riggs, Josep Marlin (June, 1982):** Cloze Testing Procedures in ESL: A prediction of Academic Success of Foreign Studies and Comparison with TOFEL Scores. Dissertation Abstracts International, Vol. 42, No. 12, P. 5048-A.
17. **Robinson, G.G. (1985):** Cloze Tests, in Husen, Torsten and Postlethwaite, T.: The International Encyclopedia of Education: Research and Studies. 2.C.770-772.
18. **Russel, D.H. (1970):** The dynamics of reading (R.B. Ruddell, Ed.). Ealtham, Ma.: Cinn and Company.
19. **Schell, L.M. (1972):** Promising possibilities for improving comprehension. Jornal of Reading, 15, 415-424.
20. **Taylor, W.L. (1953):** Cloze procedure: A new tool for measuring readability. Jornalism Quarterly, 3, 415-33.
21. ----- (1965): Recent developments in the use of "cloze procedure". Jornalism Quarterly, 33, 42-48.
22. **Turner, Carolyn Elizabeth (July, 1989):** The underlying factor structure of L2 cloze test performance in Francophone, University-level students: Causal modeling as an approach to construct validation. Dissertation Abstracts International, Vol. 50, No. 1., PP. 19-20 A.
23. **Weintraub, S. (1968):** The cloze procedure. The Reading Teacher, 21. 567-607.

8. *Johnson, T.S. (1973): Reading: Teaching and Learning. London: Macmillan Education Ltd.*
9. *Laesch, Kelly Bowers, (June, 1987): The Cloze Test as an Alternative Measure of Language Proficiency of Children Cosidered for Exit from Bilingual Education Programs. LANGUAGE LEARNING, Vol. 37, No. 2, 171-189.*
10. *Marandos, Sam Anthrong (Janary, 1983): The effect of the use of the cloze procedure employing single word and multiple sequential word deletion format on reading comprehension. Dissertation Abstracts International, Vol. 43, No., 07, P. 2221-A.*
11. *Moyle, D. (1972): The teaching of reading (3rd. ed), London Word Lock Educational.*
12. *O'Reilly, R.P. and Streeter, R.E. (April, 1976): Reports on the devlopment and validation of a system for measuring literal comprehension in a multiple-choice cloze format preliminary factor analytic results. Paper presented at the meeting of the American Education Research Association, San Francisco.*
13. *Rankin, E.J. (1957): An evaluation of the cloze procedure as a technique for measuring reading comprehension. Unpulished doctoral thesis, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan.*
14. *Rankin, E.F.Jr. (1965): The cloze procedure-a survey of research, in Thurston, E.L. and Haner, L.E. (Eds.), The philosophical and sociological bases of reading. Fourteenth year book of the national reading conference, Milwaukee: National Reading Conference.*

## REFERENCES

1. **Bastidas, Alirio (April, 1984):** The Cloze Procedure as a Teaching Technique to Improve Reading Compehension. FORUM, Vol. XXII, Number 2,20-24.
2. **Beil, Drake (1982):** A study of the effectiveness of the cloze procedure in developing reading comprehension. Dissertation Abstracts International, Vol. 42, No. 12, P. 5009-A.
3. **Bormuth, J.R. (1967):** Comparable cloze and multiple-choice comprehension test scores. Journal of Reading. 10, 291-299.
4. **Borwn, Nancy Jean (1977):** Use of the cloze procedure for monitoring elementary students' reading progres. Unpublished M.A. dissertation. University of Pittsburgh.
5. **Careen, De Waundee C. (February, 1984):** The effectiveness of the cloze procedure as an instructional technique for improving reading comprehension and enhancing divergent production (creative thought). Dissertation Abstracts International, Vol. 44, No. 98, P. 234-A.
6. **Guthrie, J.T.; Seifert, M.; Burham, N.A. and Caplan, R.I. (1974):** The maze technique to assess, monitor reading comprehension. The Reading Teacher, 28, 161-168.
7. **Honeycutt, Charles Allen (February, 1983):** A study of the second-language reading process using a cloze procedure, miscue analysis and story, retelling with third-year high school French students. Disseration Abstracts International, Vol. 43, No. 08, P. 3667-A.

different variable influencing students' progress in reading and ways for improving it.

The religious and literary readings were the first and second reading priorities for the study sample who were literarily oriented. The question is then, what would be reading preferences of the scientifically oriented student teachers be? Further investigation can answer this.

The role of the sex variable could not be determined in this study. Better designed instruments and more sophisticated statistical methods are suggested to be used to reveal this role.

In the courses of EFL teaching methods, the design, administration and correction of the cloze test are suggested to be among the topics of study for the prospective teachers of English. Ample practice and training on these areas would ensure a teacher of English who can handle the cloze procedure properly. In-service teachers of English are required to attend some training sessions for a variety of purposes, like promotion. In these sessions, they can be trained on the afore-mentioned areas for different study levels; preparatory and secondary.

The students' reading preferences are recommended to be revealed so as to be made use of on the choice of topics for the cloze passages. In so doing the use of the cloze procedure would expectedly match the students' reading comprehension.

### **Suggestions for further research:**

The findings of this study indicate the need to investigate the following areas. The cloze procedure has been proven to be valid in monitoring EFL prospective teachers' reading comprehension and implicitly their reading progress. However, the question still holds: would the same results be obtained if the cloze procedure was used in other situations like the non-specialized departments, with the EFL student teachers in other faculties of education, the students of English in the faculties of Arts, or even the preparatory and secondary students? Further investigation is expected to reveal this.

EFL student teachers' reading progress was regarded, in this study, as an implicit variable, being indicated to through the difference between the pre and post-test, assumingly that the students' advancement in reading comprehension depends mainly on their progress in reading. Specified instruments are suggested to be well designed to investigate primarily the students' reading progress. Such instruments are expected to reveal the

sample female students surpassed that of the males, there were test cases in which there were no significant differences between the two groups (for example see Tables 6,7,8,9). The role of the sex variable could not then be fully determined on the bases of the findings of this study which means that it needs further investigation.

A student's reading comprehension depends mainly on how much he/she reads and how far he/she considers himself/herself a good reader. On "the student as a reader self-rating form" more than 58% of both the males and females have rated themselves as good readers. This has to be taken like that unless proved otherwise. The remaining 42% in each group did not regard themselves as good readers. They could then be true, not telling the truth, or they might be frustrated.

The EFL students teachers' reading preferences were primarily religious and literary. The tendency to religious reading could be interpreted on the bases of the strong religious trends prevailing in society during the last two decads. The inclination to the literary readings might be due to the fact that the different branches of literature represent the major component of study in the Department of English in the Faculty of Education. Also, most of the EFL student teachers came from the literary section in the secondary schools.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

On the bases of the findings of this study the following recommendation are suggested. The cloze tests are recommended to be made use of among other test techniques to be administered, as an entry exam for the students of English in the Faculty of Education.

The cloze tests are suggested to be used to monitor students' reading comprehension in the courses of essay and exercises for the students of English. They can also be used as a test technique in the final exams.

on two only of the indicated reading preferences and differed on the majority of these areas, the sixth hypothesis is proven valid.

## CONCLUSIONS

For this study the cloze procedure has been proved to be a valid technique in monitoring EFL student teachers' reading comprehension and presumably their reading progress, as well. This is based on the notion that reading comprehension is closely related to reading and advancement in reading comprehension implies progress in reading.

The validity of the cloze procedure was sought through the correlation between the cloze test and the use of a regular test technique; a passage followed by some questions. During the pre-test phase the correlation coefficients for the whole of the study sample were highly significant (Table 4). For more validation, coefficients for males and females' scores for each academic year on the four cases of the test administration have been computed.

Also, Pearson correlation coefficients were highly significant (Table 5). These findings agree with findings of *Rankin (1965)*, *Weintraub (1968)*, *Riggs (1982)*, and *Honeycutt, (1983)*. This would ensure the validity of the cloze procedure in monitoring the students reading comprehension and consequently their reading progress.

It was believed that the sex variable would play a significant role in the findings of this study, based on the fact that females are better language learners. However, the role of sex was proved significant only in the cases of the third year, and in favour of the females (Table 10), and the second year, in the pre-test only and in favour of the male group (Table 10). This might be due to the fact that the third year female students have exceeded the male students in number (Table 1). But, the numerical surpassing cannot be taken as the only reason. Although the total number of the study



athletic, the historical, the psychological, and the cultural areas as the last. Twenty-nine males (12%) did not indicate their preferences. The following table reflects the females' responses.

**Table (14): The reading preferences for the female students.**

<b>Reading Preference</b>	<b>Students' Students</b>	<b>Percent</b>	<b>Numerical Order</b>
1	103	39.5	1
2	62	23.8	2
3	18	6.9	4
5	11	4.2	5
8	24	9.2	3
9	3	1.1	7
11	5	1.9	6
12	1	.4	8
0	34	13.0	Mising
	<b>261</b>	<b>100.0</b>	

The female students have also indicated the religious readings as their first priority, then the literary, the reading of magazines, the scientific, the political, the artistic, the historical, and the psychological as their last preference. Unexpectedly the feminine and other areas that would be attributed to the house-holding and raising of a family did not appear among their preferences. Also, thirty-four (13.0%) female students did not indicate their preferences. They appeared as missing.

It can then be concluded that both the females and males have indicated that religious reading were their first reading priority. The literary areas appeared as their second, they differed in the rest. Since they agreed

According to the values on this table the religious reading came as first priority for the EFL student teachers' reading preferences. The literary areas were the second, then reading of magazines, the political, the artistic, the psychological, and came the cultural topics as the last reading preference. The philosophical (7) and the economical (10) did not appear on this table because they were among the reading preferences which were indicated by the students whose responses had to be excluded as explained in the part of the research sample. Sixty three students did not indicate their reading preferences. So, they appeared as missing. For more details the reading preferences for the males and females were separately investigated. Consider these two tables (28, 29).

**Table (13): The reading preferences for the male students.**

<b>Reading Preference</b>	<b>Students' Students</b>	<b>Percent</b>	<b>Numerical Order</b>
1	80	33.5	1
2	44	18.4	2
3	14	5.9	5
4	1	.4	9
5	33	13.8	3
6	9	3.8	6
8	23	9.6	4
9	4	1.7	7
12	2	.8	8
0	29	12.1	Missing
	<b>239</b>	<b>100.0</b>	

The male students have indicated the religious areas as their priority, then the literary, the political, the reading of magazines, the scientific, the

According to the values obtained on this table, 58% of the males and 58.99% of the females have scored fifteen points or more. As such they can be regarded as good readers. Consequently the fifth hypothesis is considered valid.

Concerning the students' reading preferences which represented the core of the sixth hypothesis, they were arranged for the statistical treatment as follows:

1. **R** = religious      2. **L.** = Literary      3. **Sc.** = Scientific  
 4. **C.** = Cultural      5. **P.** = Political      6. **Ath.** = Athletic  
 7. **Ph.** = Philosophical      8. **M.** = Magazines      9. **H.** = Historical  
 10. **E.** = Economical      11. **Ar.** = Artistic      11. **Ps.** = Psychological

**Table (12): The reading preferences for the whole sample.**

Reading Preference	Students' Number	Percent	Numerical Order
1	183	36.6	1
2	106	21.2	2
3	32	6.4	5
4	1	.2	10
5	44	8.8	4
6	9	1.8	6
8	47	9.0	3
9	7	1.4	7
11	5	1.0	8
12	3	.6	9
0	63	12.6	Missing

is why the fifth and sixth hypotheses were formulated. For the fifth hypothesis, the total score of a student on the self rating form is out of twenty-five (25). A student would be considered a good reader if he/she scored fifteen (15) points or more.

**Table (11): Students as good readers percentage for the males and females students.**

Males			Females		
Value	Frequency	Percent	Value	Frequency	Percent
7	1	.4	8	2	8
8	1	.4	10	7	2.7
9	1	.4	1	8	3.1
10	2	.8	12	6	2.3
11	3	1.3	13	16	6.1
12	8	3.3	14	17	6.5
13	9	3.8	15	18	6.9
14	20	8.4	16	32	12.3
15	20	8.4	17	42	16.1
16	27	11.3	18	33	12.6
17	51	21.3	19	39	14.9
18	22	9.2	20	20	7.7
19	24	10.0	21	11	4.2
20	25	10.5	22	7	2.7
21	12	5.0	23	2	.8
22	1	4.6	25	1	.4
25	2	.8			

**Total:** 239  
58.2%

100.0

**Total:** 261  
58.99%

100.0

For the first year student's scores means, the t-value is insignificant in all the four test cases, which means that their standards were equal in the pre-test and they have also achieved equal advancement in the post-test.

As for the second years students, the t-value is significant on X 31 and X 41 whereas insignificant on X 32 and X 42. This means that the second year males and females have got unequal standards in the pre-test. The males have surpassed the females, but they have achieved equal advancement in the post-test. So, the sex variable played a significant role in the pre-test only.

As regards the third year students, the t-value is significant in all the test cases. This means that there were significant differences between the scores of the male and female students in the pre-and post tests. These differences were in favour of the females. So, the females have surpassed the males.

In regard to the fourth year students, the t-value is not significant in all the four test cases. This means that there were no significant differences between the male and female students' score means. The variable of sex had no effect in this respect.

The fourth hypothesis has been proven valid only in terms of the pre-test scores of the second year students and the scores of the third year students in both cases. However, as regards the scores of the first year, the second year (post-test) and the fourth year students' score means, this hypothesis has been proved invalid. Accordingly, no final judgement could be made concerning the role of the sex variable. It's up to further investigation to clarify this point.

A learner's reading comprehension depends on his/her reading progress which, by turn, has to do with his/her reading preferences. This

Table (10): The t-value for the differences in the score means of all four years male and female students on X 31, X 32, X 41 & X 42.

	NC	X 31				X 32				X 41				X 42				
		M	SD	t value	2-Tail prob.	M	SD	t value	2-Tail prob.	M	SD	t value	2-Tail prob.	M	SD	t value	2-Tail prob.	
First	Males	63	77.27	21.74	.55	.783	79.59	22.04	.91	.365	76.48	21.69	.39	.700	78.52	22.58	.69	.491
	Females	65	75.58	1.34			82.48	12.89			77.66	11.71			80.89	15.36		
Second	Males	54	76.93	11.76	2.2*	.046	81.72	13.35	1.48	.141	77.56	11.85	2.13*	.035	81.87	13.36	1.69	.093
	Females	47	71.17	16.76			77.26	16.26			71.57	16.21			76.68	17.37		
Third	Males	70	53.49	18.25	2.21*	.025	59.87	17.94	1.98*	.052	55.45	17.99	2.19*	.030	61.57	17.54	2.19*	.030
	Females	96	60.48	21.39			67.31	22.88			62.68	22.54			68.62	22.44		
Fourth	Males	52	61.65	16.75	.27	.787	67.33	19.28	.03	.980	65.19	15.82	.40	.694	72.25	16.73	.71	.480
	Females	53	62.43	12.49			67.25	12.63			64.08	13.03			70.09	14.33		

Tailed Significance : .01\*

comprehension in the pre-test as measured by the regular method. This result validated the result obtained on Table 6. The results of the post-test are provided in the following table.

**Table (9): The t-value for the differences, between males and females'score means on X 42.**

<b>Variables Prob.</b>	<b>NC</b>	<b>M</b>	<b>DM</b>	<b>SD</b>	<b>t value</b>	<b>2-Tail</b>
Group 1	239	77.9498		19.732	28	.783
Group 2	261	3.4291	.4793	19.055		

The t-value is insignificant, as well. There were no significant differences between males and females' score means in reading comprehension on the regular method in the post-test. This indicates that both males and females have equally achieved the same degree of advancement. This result would also validate the result obtained on Table 7.

From the previous four tables, sex played no significant role in the achievement of both males and females, either in the pre or the post-test. To further investigate this role, the researcher compared the scores of both males and females in each academic year, separately.

**Table (7): The t-value for the differences, between males and females'score means on X 32.**

<b>Variables</b>	<b>NC</b>	<b>M</b>	<b>DM</b>	<b>SD</b>	<b>t value</b>	<b>2-Tailed Prob.</b>
Group 1	239	71.676	.8705	20.588	.49	.625
Group 2	261	72.4981		19.055		

The t-value has also proved insignificant. There was not any significant difference between males and females' score means in reading comprehension on the cloze test in the post-test. This also, means that both males and females have achieved nearly the same degree of advancement. The next two tables would show the differences in males and females' scores as measured by the regular method.

**Table (8): The t-value for the differences, between males and females' score means on X 41.**

<b>Variables</b>	<b>NC</b>	<b>M</b>	<b>DM</b>	<b>SD</b>	<b>t value</b>	<b>2-Tailed Prob.</b>
Group 1	239	68.1339	.1611	19.707	.09	.925
Group 2	261	68.2950		18.413		

The t-value is not significant. There was not any significant difference between males and females' score means in reading



All values are highly significant. So, the validity of the cloze procedure in comparison with the regular method in monitoring students' reading comprehension and implicitly their reading progress has been determined. As such, the third hypothesis is true, as well.

In terms of the fourth hypothesis these results were obtained:

**Table (6): The t-value for the differences between males and females'score means on X 31.**

<b>Tail Variables</b>	<b>NC</b>	<b>M</b>	<b>DM</b>	<b>SD</b>	<b>t value</b>	<b>2 - Prob.</b>
Group 1 Males	239	66.8285	0.2653	20.513	.15	.878
Group 2 Females	261	66.5632		17.915		

The t-value proved insignificant which means that the differences between males and females' scores had no significance. This also, indicates that there was not much differences in the standard of reading comprehension between males and females in the pre-test, being measured by the cloze-test. As for the post test, these results were obtained.

**Table (5): The pearson Corr. for both males and females' scores on X 31, X 32, X 41 &42 in each academic year.**

Academic	Group	No.of	Corr.	X 41	X 42
<b>First</b>	Males	63	X 31 X 32	.9657**	.8537**
	Females	65	X 31 X 32	.9529**	.6955**
<b>Second</b>	Males	54	X 31 X 32	.9118**	.9150**
	Females	47	X 31 X 32	.9752**	.9366**
<b>Third</b>	Males	70	X 31 X 32	.9747**	.9388**
	Females	96	X 31 X 32	.9879**	.9772**
<b>Fourth</b>	Males	52	X 31 X 32	.9743**	.8889**
	Females	53	X 31 X 32	.9893**	.9542**

1. tailed significance : \* -.01 \*\* -.001

X 31 (the pre-test cloze), X 32 (the post-test cloze),

X 41 (the pre-test regular method), and X 42 (the post-test regular method). This is provided in the following table.

**Table (4): The Pearson correlations between S's scores on X 31, X 32, X 41 &42.**

<b>Correlations</b>	<b>X 31</b>	<b>X 32</b>	<b>X 41</b>	<b>X 42</b>
X 31	1.0000	0.9666**	0.9758*	0.9173**
X 32	0.9666**	1.0000	0.9622**	0.9165**
X 41	0.9758**	0.9622**	1.0000	0.9320**
X 42	0.9173**	0.9320**	0.9320**	1.0000

N. of cases 500 1-tailed signif.: \* 0.1 \*\* .001.

The correlation coefficients between X 31 and X 41 (0.9758) and between X 32 and X 42 (0.9165) are statistically significant which means that the use of the cloze test could elicit student's reading comprehension as well as the regular method. The second hypothesis is then proved true. This also, indicates to the validity of the cloze procedure in monitoring students' reading comprehension and progress. For more validation the Pearson Correlation coefficients for X 31, X 32, X 41 & X 42 for both males and females have been separately computed, in each academic year.

According to the highly significant t-value, there were statistically significant differences between students' scores in the pre and post test on the cloze test in favour of the post-test. This also, means that their standard in reading comprehension has advanced and implicitly their reading have progressed.

As for their reading comprehension as measured by the regular method, the following results were obtained.

**Table (3): The t-value for the differences between students' score means in the pre and post test in reading comprehension as measured by the regular method.**

<b>Variable</b>	<b>NC</b>	<b>M</b>	<b>DM</b>	<b>SD</b>	<b>T value</b>	<b>2-Tail Prob.</b>
X 41 (Pre-test)	500	68.2180	4.9820	7.086	15.72	0.000
X4 2 (Post-test)	500	73.2000				

The t-value is also highly significant and in favour of the post-test which means that students' reading comprehension has advanced and their reading has implicitly progressed. As such the first hypothesis has been proved true.

As for how valid the cloze procedure is in monitoring students' reading comprehension and progress, which is the core of the second hypothesis, it cannot be judged except with computing the correlation between the students' scores on these test cases.

imposed. In the next week, they were administered the regular reading comprehension text. They were also required to read the test instructions carefully and respond as shown. Answers were provided on separate answer sheets. The same four colleagues did the correction. For the cloze test, a copy of each of the two passage with the original words being underlined was handed on to each of them. Correction and scoring for both were done as explained in the part of research instrument.

Three months later, in March 1990, the students were administered the same test for post-test, which was conducted in the same manner. This time the "student as a reader self rating form" was administered. Correction and scoring were also done in the same way. The students' scores were then arranged for the statistical treatment.

**The statistical treatment of the results:**

The results of this study have been computed on an SPSS Personal Computer. For the first hypothesis the following results were obtained,

**Table (2): The t-value for differences between students'score means in both the pre and post test cases on the cloze test for all students.**

<b>Variable</b>	<b>Number cases of</b>	<b>Mean</b>	<b>Differences mean</b>	<b>Standard deviation</b>	<b>T value</b>	<b>2-Tail Prob.</b>
X 31 (Pre-test)	500	66.6900	5.3920	5.074	23.76	0.000
X 32 (Post-test)	500	72.0820				

expressed their consent. Reliability through test-retest has been checked. Reliability coefficients reached .88, .86, .90 & .92.

**Research Sample:**

The research sample for this study included all students in the Department of English, Faculty of Education, Zagazig University, except those whose responses have to be excluded as they did not respond to all the instruments in either or both the pre and post test cases. The distribution of the sample was as follows:

**Table (I): The distribution and percentage of the sample.**

<b>Academic Year</b>	<b>Sex</b>		<b>Total</b>
	<b>Male</b>	<b>Female</b>	
1	63	65	128
2	54	47	101
3	70	96	166
4	52	53	105
Total	239	261	500
Percentage	47.8	52.2	100

**The experimental procedures:**

The conduction of the pre-test took place in the first semester of the academic year 1989/1990; December, 1989. With the help of four colleagues; Ph.D. holders in TEFL, the cloze test was administered to the students of each academic year. The students were required to read the test instructions carefully and respond as indicated. No time limit was

Each of the two passages was typed as an 80 item, every fifth-word deletion cloze, unless this fifth word is an article. Deletions were marked by lines in spaces. A student's score in both the pre and post test cases would be out of 160, then divided on 2, it was finally out of 80. Correlation was not limited to the original deleted words. Synonyms were also taken as correct.

### **B. The regular reading comprehension test:**

This test was meant for comparison purposes to ensure the validity of the cloze procedure in monitoring students' reading comprehension. This test is composed of the same two passages (The Rich and the Poor and Automation) with no deletion. Following each passage are six questions. Each correct answer takes ten (10) points. An answer is held correct as it is consistent with the rules of grammar and provides the required ideas. Spelling mistakes are disregarded if they are few. Scoring procedures for this test remained the same like the cloze test.

For validity, the test was submitted to the jury members who approved of it. Reliability has been checked by the test-retest method. Correlation coefficients were .81, .79, .82, .79. For the sake of comparison, the correlation coefficient between the score means of the same students on this test and theirs on the cloze test has been computed. It reached .90.

### **C. The student as a reader self rating form:**

The aim of this instrument is to give the students the opportunity of ratify themselves as reader. It is composed of ten (10) questions addressed to self' about the time, frequency, enjoyment & areas of reading. (See Appendices). It has been submitted to the same jury members. After making some modification in the phrasing of some questions they

### **A. The cloze test for reading comprehension:**

The primary goal for the use of this test was to assess the students' reading comprehension. Selecting a passage has been determined considering that too difficult passage would be frustrating. Students would also, regard a too easy passage as a time wasting. Two passages were selected. The first (The Rich and The Poor), includes 36 lines in 5 paragraphs. It is extracted from (Robert O. Neill's Kernel Lessons Plus, A Post-Intermediate Course-see appendices). This passage is regarded as relatively easy in the sense that it does not require extra effort and full concentration to grasp the meaning. To check this, five students from each grade level were randomly selected to read the passage silently, only for once. They were then, individually interviewed. Each student was asked to give an oral account in a few minutes time for the main ideas. Students' responses were in general terms satisfactory.

The second passage (Automation) includes 39 lines in 3 paragraphs. It is extracted from (L.G. Alexander's Developing Skills-see appendices). Unlike the other passage, this one is viewed as more difficult as it required more concentration. The same groups of students have asked for another attempt. It took them three to five attempts to respond satisfactorily.

For validation the two passages were submitted to a jury, five Ph.D. holders in TEFL with the supposedly deleted words underlined and the test instructions being explained. They approved of it. The cloze test reliability has been determined by the test-retest method. Fifty students from each grade level were randomly selected and administered the test. Reliability coefficients for the four cases were: .79, .80, .82, .81. These were determined as acceptable.



Consequently, the aforementioned discussion resulted in the formulation of the following hypotheses.

**Research hypotheses:**

1. There would be significant differences between the students' score means in the pre and post-test conditions in reading comprehension being measured by the cloze test and the regular method (passages followed by questions).
2. Students' scores on the cloze test would significantly correlate with theirs on the regular method.
3. From 1 and 2 it could be hypothesized that the use of the cloze procedure would be determined as valid in monitoring EFL student teachers' reading comprehension and progress.
4. In terms of sex there would be significant differences in the degree of the probable improvement between males and females.
5. EFL student teachers would rate themselves as good readers on the "student as a reader self rating form".
6. There would be differences between males and females in their reading preferences.

**Research Instruments:**

For this study three groups of instruments have been designed to test the validity of the research hypothesis. These include a cloze test (two passages). For reading comprehension, a regular reading comprehension test (the same two passages with eight questions on each) and a student as a reader self rating form. These are discussed in the following section.

that subjects tended to use discourse type different from that of the passage read to organize the protocols.

The previous review of literature revealed some of the various contributions that could be obtained through the used of the cloze procedure. It has positive effects in developing or assessing reading comprehension. *Marandos (1983)*. As a teaching technique it has useful gains: *Gareen (1984) and Bastidad (1984)*. However, the use of this procedure as a measure of intersentential comprehension did not yield significant results: *Markham (1984)*. In other cases, the resulting gains in developing reading comprehension could not be determined in statistically significant terms *Beil (1982)*.

The validity of the cloze procedure as a test technique has been studied through investigating the correlation between the cloze tests and other test techniques. *Honeycutt's Study (1983)* proved that the cloze tests are as valid as other test techniques. *Turner's Study (1983)* showed that the cloze has been considered as an overall second language proficiency measure. *Riggs (1982)* reached the conclusion that the cloze tests are better predictors of a grade-point-average than the TOFEL. Nevertheless, the cloze test did not significantly correlate with other test techniques: *Laesch (1987)*.

So, no final judgement could be issued as regards the effects of the cloze procedure in the EFL teaching/learning situation. These effects, whether positive or negative, should be considered within the circumstances of each study. Also, the author could not find studies which dealt with the differences between the two sexes, in this respect. However, it is always persuasive to include various variables on studying some phenomenon. Psychologically, females exceed males in the linguistic ability. In addition, the inclusion of other variables would lead to a more comprehensive understanding of the phenomenon under investigation.

over linguistic boundaries. Cloze has been considered as an overall L2 proficiency measure. This study empirically demonstrates that factors other than language are significantly contributing to cloze performance. It also demonstrates the potential of causal modeling approach.

**2. Vassar (1988):** "The sensitivity of cloze procedure to passage organization".

The purpose of this study was to investigate the sensitivity of the cloze procedure to text organization by examining the cloze restoration of tenth grade students on two sets of passages having equivalent/identical content but different top-level structure. Two experiments were conducted: (1) cloze restoration using two expository texts (A & B); and (2) written recall of textual propositions utilizing the same passage versions, but unmultilated as in the first experiment. A total of 96 tenth graders in a public high school in the Peninsula area of Virginia participated in the study. Each subject read and restored cloze deletions on one version of the passage in Text A and on the different version of the passage in Text B,. In experiment 2, one week later, the same participants read and completed written recall tests instead of restoring deleted work.

Overall results for both Text A and B show better cloze restoration in the Well-Ordered condition, but better recall of idea units in the less Well-Ordered conditions.

Results of an item analysis of the total cloze restoration in the super ordinate idea units in the passages of both Text A and Text B indicated that the adversative top-level organization of Text A, Well-Ordered and the response top-level structure of Text B, Well-Ordered facilitated more cloze restoration than the attributive structure (Less Well-Ordered) of the two texts. Experiment 2 for both WO and LWO passages of Tex A revealed

easy to construct, administer, and score. In addition, the cloze test could be taken directly from actual text books used in freshman coursework, so face validity of the test was maximum. To test the hypothesis that such cloze test would be better predictors of GPA than TOEFL scores, a study using twenty-three foreign students at Vincennes University was completed. The results of the study, using cloze tests constructed from freshman texts, TOEFL scores, A GPA's compiled over a two-semester period, clearly show that cloze tests should be used to supplement other admission data such as the TOEFL score, because the CLOZE-GPA correlation was about double that of TOEFL-GPA for the first semester.

### **Group III: Studies concerned with the text organization and structure:**

- 1. Turner (1988):** "The underlying factor structure of L2 cloze test performance in Francophone, university level students: causal modeling as an approach to construct validation".

This study investigated the underlined factor structure of second language (L2) cloze test performance as explained by a theoretical model including the following hypothetical constructs: cloze-taking ability, knowledge of language, knowledge of text content, and knowledge of contextual constraints. Eight cloze tests reflecting the posited factors were constructed and administered to 182 Francophone, university-level students. The factors were examined separately and in combination through a causal model building process. A model composed of three orthogonal factors was confirmed and accepted as the best explanation of the data. The results indicate that cloze performance is dependent upon knowledge of a specific language (second language or first language) and nonlinguistic-specific knowledge related to cloze-taking ability that crosses

Pearson's product moment correlation was determined between scores on the LAS and the cloze test to determine the extent to which the two test methods were measuring the same skills. The correlation was not significant ( $r = .25$ ).

**3. Riggs (1982): "Cloze Testing Procedures in ESL: A Prediction of Academic Success of Foreign Students and Comparison with TOEFL scores".**

Evaluations of admissibility of foreign student to American junior colleges, colleges, and universities typically involves scrutiny of, among other things, one's scores of the Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL). The results of this study suggest the use of another measure, a cloze test score on cloze tests prepared from actual course texts used in freshman classes at the school to which the student is applying. Cloze tests are of fill-in-the blank format, wherein the examinee is given a running passage extracted from some corpus of prose, the passage is then re-typed for testing purposes, and in this step the prose passage becomes "cloze" by deleting every "nth" (usually the fifth, sixth, or seventh) word and replacing the word with a blank, in which the examinee is directed to write one and only one English word to complete the thought of the sentence. Because it was observed at Vincennes University that some foreign students with TOEFL scores from 380 to 450 were able to maintain a grade point-average (GPA) of 3.5/4.0 or higher, a search for measure that would yield a better prediction of GPA was begun. Tests of English as a foreign language are all to a greater or lesser degree either integrative or discrete-point tests, and a test may be said to be located somewhere along continuum from one extreme to the other with few (if any) absolutes possible. Considerations of various types of tests and testing formats followed, with final selection of a cloze procedure because of the powerful theoretical support in favour of its classification as heavily integrative and because it is

The good and poor reader (n = 18) read aloud a short narrative in French; then they retold the passage in English. The researcher asked additional questions to further gauge comprehension. Miscue analysis revealed that the good readers made significantly fewer miscues than the poor ones. Analysis of the story retelling showed that the good readers scored significantly higher.

Correlations between the French cloze scores both exact and acceptable, the miscue analysis score, and the story retelling were strong and significant ( *r*/from- .36 to + .6). The researcher concluded that the cloze, oral reading, and story retelling were valid measures of the reading ability of the subjects in French and that they were successful in differentiating between two significantly different levels of reading ability.

**2. Laesch (1987): " The Cloze Test as an Alternative Measure of Language Proficiency of Children Considered for Exit from Bilingual Education Programs:**

In this study the validity of a traditional language test Language Assessment Scale (LAS), and an integrated test, the cloze test, in measuring academic language proficiency was assessed. The LAS and two written cloze passages were administered to 28 Mexican-American third graders enrolled in bilingual education classes and compared to their performance on the California Test of Basic Skills (CTBS). Results indicate that correlations between LAS and CTBS, and LAS and the cloze test are nonsignificant, whereas the cloze test correlates significantly with all subtests of the CTBS. An error analysis for cloze responses reveals that subjects make proportionally fewer errors in using syntactic cues as their total errors decrease. For reliability interscorer reliability was determined as .95, based upon the mean percentage of agreement between the two scorers. As for the relationship between the cloze test and the LAS a

Subjects were randomly assigned to one of the two treatment conditions which consisted of twelve cloze passages using the respective single or multiple word deletion format. Subjects using the MSD tasks did significantly better in general comprehension acquisition (measured by the CTBS) thereby supporting the major hypothesis of the study and the sequential redundancy model of reading. Two other hypotheses were upheld and another was directionally supported.

**Group II: Studies concerned with the validity of the cloze procedure in comparison with other test techniques:**

- 1. Honeycutt (1983):** "A study of the second language reading process using a cloze procedure, miscue analysis, and story telling with third-year high school French students".

The study was designed to examine the second-language reading process to see if there was a correlation between the ability to read English, the native language, and the ability to read French, the second language; to examine the quantitative and qualitative differences between subjects identified as good (the upper 20%) and poor (the lower 20%) readers on the basis of their exact score on the French cloze; and to see how well the different instruments : the cloze tests, miscue analysis, and story telling correlated with each other.

Sixty tenth-grade third-year high-school students of French were administered an English and a French cloze test, each consisting of 50 blanks with every seventh word randomly deleted. The French cloze tests scored both by the exact and an acceptable scoring method correlated significantly (  $r$  between .36 and .48) with the English cloze.

than either the product group or those receiving traditional reading instruction, (2) Also, in all instances the product approach instructed students achieved high (although not significantly) mean scores than the group instructed traditionally. It would appear that the cloze procedure method of teaching reading comprehension, especially instruction via the process approach, is an extremely viable and efficient method of instruction.

**4. Marandos (1983):** "The effect of the use of the cloze procedure employing single word and multiple sequential word deletion format on reading comprehension".

Traditionally the cloze procedure utilizing single word deletion has been used in research as an assessment and instructional tool, but some of the literature has indicated that the single word deletion procedure use remains essentially on the literal level. This study has proposed a multiple word cloze procedure which demands that the reader makes evaluations, critical analyses, synthesizes the information and draws conclusions.

A 2 x 2 mixed experimental design employing ANCOVA analysis was used with fifty-four fifth graders in a rural school of northern California. The mixed design allowed comparisons between treatment groups and testing conditions within groups.

The two independent variables were: (1) cloze deletion treatment and (2) Testing conditions. The three dependent variables were (1) Correct responses on the multiple word deletion cloze test (MWD), (2) Correct responses on the single word deletion cloze test (SWD), and (3) The California Test of Basic Skills (CTBS) comprehension test.



In two of three districts in Hawaii public schools, secondary Title I students in close treatment groups had significantly ( $p = .01$ ) greater gains in comprehension, than non-treatment Title I students in the same districts and grade levels. Thus, significant gains in reading comprehension were produced in two of three districts in which cloze instructional programs were conducted. However, the reason for this positive effect of the treatment could not be determined in statistically significant terms.

**3. Careen (1984):** "The effectiveness of the cloze procedure as an instructional technique for improving reading comprehension and enhancing divergent production (creative thought)".

***This study compared three instructional strategies:***

(1) The product approach, which accepts only the exact word for the deleted language pattern, (2) the process approach, which accepts synonyms for the deleted language pattern, and (3) traditional reading instruction. Ninety six grade students were randomly assigned in equal proportions to the three instructional groups. The study used a modified post test only control group design involving the use of two experimental groups exposed to different forms of the same treatment, cloze procedure, and a comparison group exposed to traditional reading instruction. The groups were exposed to the same subject matter. Dependent variable consisted of two measures of reading comprehension an Investigator Made Cloze Test and the comprehension scale of Gates-MacGinitie Reading Tests, and two measures of divergent production.

The results of the study were as follows: (1) Students receiving instruction via the process method of instruction showed significant increase in reading comprehension scores and divergent production scores

13. Finally the teacher can again show the class the original passage and compare it to the students' answers.

The author thinks that the cloze procedure must be viewed as a supplement to other techniques for improving reading comprehension. Its flexibility as a teaching technique for reading comprehension in EFL classroom affords an excellent challenge for both teachers and students. It enhances the teacher's ability to make up cloze procedure tests, and provides the students with familiarity and confidence in taking them. He, finally hopes that future research and application will combine a theoretical basis with practical studies in EFL/ESL classroom in order to make the cloze procedure a powerful testing and teaching technique for reading comprehension.

2. **Beil (1982):** A study of the effectiveness of the cloze procedure in developing reading comprehension.

The purpose of this study was to design, construct, validate and employ cloze instructional materials to improve the reading comprehension of Title I students in secondary grade levels in the State of Hawaii. A total of 117 students in three schools received twenty cloze activities, one every five to ten days, during the course of 1980-1981 school year. Instruction included having students complete each 200-500 word passage on world mythology, and conducting discussions on whether answers were meaningful, caused meaning changes, or meaningless. The passages increased in difficulty from second through tenth grade level. An every tenth word deletion pattern was used throughout the passages, and additional cueing was made available to students as the passages grew more difficult.

4. The teacher now reads the passage aloud, trying to maintain a correct intonation and making the necessary pauses.
5. The teacher tells the students to read the first paragraph again, silently. Afterward, the teacher directs a discussion, with the whole group participating.
6. The teacher gives some clues to help the students find the correct, or acceptable words. Here, the teacher has the opportunity to provide information about syntactic and semantic clues that will help the students discover the missing words.
7. If after doing the previous step, there are still some doubtful choices, the teacher can give the first letter of the correct word.
8. After the class has finished the first paragraph, the teacher asks one student to read it aloud to see whether it makes sense.
9. The teacher shows the class the original paragraph, using an overhead project (if available), and tells the students to compare it with the one they have just completed.
10. In order to provide variety, the teacher divides the class into small groups, and tells them to read the next paragraph and to suggest possible words.
11. While the students are working in groups, the teacher should interact each group and work as a facilitator.
12. Then the teacher can ask each group to report their findings, along with reasons. The teacher must be ready to clarify any doubts.

## **REVIEW OF \* LITERATURE**

The focus in this part is on some studies which have been conducted to reveal some contributions of the cloze procedure in different academic situations. These studies concentrated mostly on assessing and/or developing reading comprehension. There are studies which attempted to seek validation of the cloze technique in comparison with other test techniques. Other studies investigated the text organization and structure. These studies are thus grouped in three groups according to the theme.

### **Group I: Studies concerned with reading comprehension:**

- 1. Bastidas (1984):** "The Cloze Procedure as a Teaching Technique to Improve Reading Comprehension".

The author suggests a plan for using to cloze procedure as a teaching strategy. This plan comprises thirteen steps.

- 1.** The teacher begins the class by stating the purpose of the activity and announcing the title of the passage. He asks questions about the title. In this way, the students begin to build up some predictions.
- 2.** If the students are not familiar with the cloze procedure, the teacher should devote some time to explaining its purpose and how to guess the missing words with the help of the context.
- 3.** Then the teacher hands out the cloze passage. Students are directed to read quickly and silently the first and last sentences which do not have any deletions.

comprehension and progress? This broadly stated question was subdivided into these questions:

1. How far is the use of the cloze procedure valid in monitoring student teachers' reading comprehension in comparison with another technique (questions on a passage)?
2. Is the use of the cloze procedure useful in monitoring the students' reading progress? (Reading progress refers to the difference, if significant, between students' pre and post test scores being obtained on the cloze test and the regular technique of questions on a passage.
3. Since reading comprehension and progress have to do with a student's rate of reading, how do EFL student teachers rate themselves as readers?
4. If the rate of reading has to do with a reader's reading preferences, what are the students' reading preferences?

#### **Significance of the study:**

This study is hopefully expected to throw some light on some of the various contributions of the cloze procedure being used to achieve a variety of academic purposes, among which is monitoring EFL student teachers' reading comprehension and reading progress. So, the results of this study would or not recommend the use of the cloze procedure in this respect.

#### **Limitations of the study:**

This study was limited to the EFL student teachers from the Faculty of Education, Zagazig University. All students in the Department of English participated in this study.

**Weintraub (1968)** reported that "Gallant obtained correlation coefficients at the primary grade levels ranging from .65 to .81 between scores on the paragraph reading section of a standardized reading test and scores obtained on a comparable form of the same test rewritten as a cloze test" (p. 569). Thus there is evidence that the cloze procedure measures aspects quite similar to the standard idea of comprehension as measured by questions on passages. Accordingly, establishing the validity of the cloze as a monitoring device for students' comprehension and progress in reading in this study has been similarly determined. To conclude this part, **Laesch (1987)** stated that:

In fact, the cloze test has been found to be a valid and reliable measure of overall second language proficiency in both adults (**Darnell, 1968; Stubbs and Tcker, 174; Oller and Hinofotis, 1980**) and children (**Swain, Laphin and Barik, 1976; Ojerinde, 1980**). Its validity has also been substantiated as a measure of reading comprehension and general academic performance of both monolingual (**Gallant, 1965; Bormuth, 1967 and Stamp, 1978**) and bilingual children (**Swain, Lapkin and Barik, 1976; Baldauf and Propst, 1978 and Streiff, 1978**) (p. 174).

The previous discussion threw much light on the various contributions that could be obtained through the use of the cloze procedure in measuring the students' reading comprehension. But, the question still holds: can we draw similar results through using the cloze procedure in monitoring our student teachers' reading comprehension and progress? The empirical part of this study would reveal this.

### **Statement of the problem:**

In the light of the previous discussion, the problem under investigation could be stated the following questions: How valid is the cloze procedure in monitoring EFL student teachers' reading

conception can thereby, be taken as effective in determining the passage readability. On the other hand, if other instructional purposes like assesing students' reading comprehension and progress are the main concern, a synonym may be regarded as equally right. **Brown (1977)** stated that:

The research suggests that for measuring readability the exact word only procedure is probably reasonable but for teaching purposes synonyms should be scored as correct also. There is some evidence to support the scoring of synonyms for measuring reading comprehension. In either case the score on a cloze test is usually reported in terms of the proportion of correct responses (p. 19).

Also, unlike **Taylor, Rankin (1965)** stated that "for purposes of teaching with the cloze exercises, giving credit for synonyms is probably advisable. This procedure has more face validity from the standpoint of the student, and the student receives more positive reinforcement" (p. 147). There is research evidence that there is no significant difference between the two approaches. **Rankin (1965)** found "correlations of .86 and .92 between cloze scores based on objective and synonym scoring systems for two different tests" (p. 146). It is thereby that a synonym has been taken, in this study, as correct as an exact word.

As regards the validity of the cloze procedure as a monitoring device for students' reading comprehension, there have been studies which dealt with the cloze concurrent validity in cmparison with measures of reading comprehension based on the same passage as the cloze and general measures of reading achievement such as standardized tests. **Rankin (1965)** stated that "Correlations between cloze tests and standadized reading tests establish the concurrent validity of cloze tests as measures of general reading achievement (p. 155).

- e- Delete systematically one, two, or three words if the sentence is long.
- (2) Using a long passage, and keeping the context, semantics, and syntax in mind:
- a- Delete every nth word systematically, and provide three of four choices for each blank.
  - b- Delete every nth word systematically but leave some letters.
  - c- Delete every nth word systematically.
- (3) Precede the passage with brief, clear directions on how to fill in the blanks (pp. 22-23).

For the study purposes the original Taylor's method has been used. Every nth (fifth) words was deleted unless it was an article. Also, contractors such as can't or don't were taken as single words.

The cloze procedure can then be administered to groups or individuals. There are usually no time constraints with the cloze. **Brown (1977)** recommends that "The student can take as long as needed to complete the passage (p. 18). This has been adopted in this study.

The scoring of a cloze test can be based on the examinee, supplying the exact word or synonym for the deleted words. **Robinson (1985)** reported that:

In Taylor's early work he awarded half points for synonyms of the word originally used by the author. He regarded as suspect the subjectivity involved in making them and, as there is a correlation of 0.95 with the results of verbatim cloze, where only exact replacements are accepted, little benefit occurs from accepting them (p.771).

According to **Taylor (1956)** "There was no advantage to putting oneself to the trouble of judging and scoring synonyms" (p. 48). This



3. Prepare your own material. They are excellent resources. Write them with specific purposes and students in mind.
4. Use this student's written compositions from the previous courses. They are generally written with an unsophisticated vocabulary, simple structures, and concrete meaning.
5. Prepare words cards to complete the meaning of a short sentence or paragraph.
6. Transfer the passage to a transparency for use with an overhead projector (if available). Once the transparency has been prepared, select words and mark off with masking tape.
7. Select familiar rhymes, jingles, and short stories (p. 22).

After choosing the passage and while constructing the material it is recommended that an examiner must not forget to adapt it for his specific students, purposes, content areas, vocabulary or concepts and carefully sequence them according to difficulty and length. In this respect, the following procedure is suggested by *Richardson (1980)*.

- (1) Using a sentence as a resource for the modified cloze passage and taking into account the content clues:
  - a- Delete systematically every nth word, but leave either the consonants or the vowels.
  - b- Delete systematically every nth word, but leave the initial and the final letters.
  - c- Delete every nth word, but leave either the initial letter or the final letter of each word.
  - d- Delete every nth word, and provide three or four choices.

words. The student is then required to write the answers within the text. Another quicker method involves making a photocopy of the passage and blackening out the words selected for deletion. The student can then place his answers on a separate answer sheet.

Whatever the method used in constructing the cloze test, **Robinson (1985)** argues that:

The fundamental principle is that the deletions should be random. It is this that clearly distinguishes cloze from sentence completion tasks where the words are examined by the test constructor to determine which word should be removed. Thus the efficiency of the test depends upon the ability of the constructor. In cloze the words are not evaluated and it is not therefore subject to the bias of the test constructor (p. 770).

In this respect, **Robinson** holds **Taylor's** conception (1953) that "If enough words are struck out at random, the blanks will come to represent proportionately all kinds of words to the extent that they occur" (p. 419). Also, Robinson thinks that:

A word is defined by the white space with which the author has separated it from other words, contractions such as can't or don't counting as single words. The hyphen is treated as white space if the parts are free forms as in self-conscious but re-activate would be regarded as a single word (p. 771).

Also, in the construction of a cloze test there are some considerations that must be taken into account in the selection of the cloze passages. **Jesus (1984)** thinks that "The selection depends on the objectives you have stated in advance" (p. 22). **Richardson (1980)**, cited in Jesus provides these suggestions:

1. Choose the passages that have high interest level and are at the reading level of your students.
2. Select interesting stories.

**Rankin (1957)** in his doctoral thesis made a distinction between two types of cloze. Structural cloze refers to the nth deletion. It is hereby that the majority of the deleted words are the ones that indicate the relationships between words. Lexical cloze refers to deletions of every word of a particular grammatical form. Nouns and verbs being most often selected but other parts of speech such as adjectives, adverbs, and pronouns may be used.

A multiple-choice cloze (MCC) has been developed by **O'Reilly and Streeter (1976)**. It is a form of cloze which is intended to help in solving the question of whether to score the exact words only or their corresponding synonyms. For each deletion, in this form, five possible response choices are supplied, one of which is the exact word deleted from the passage. All of the distractors would be grammatically correct in the deleted space but less appropriate to the meaning of the passage. According to **Brown (1977)**:

The MCC is a lexical cloze with only nouns, verbs, adjectives and adverbs being deleted. Besides, solving the problem of whether to score exact only or synonyms as correct, the MCC eliminates the need for hand scoring. However, it involves some of the same problems as tests based on questions in terms of the difficulty of the distractors and the greater time needed for test construction (p. 20).

The most common procedure ever used has been the pre-cloze in which the student does not see the passage before the actual cloze test. A less frequent procedure, called the post-cloze involves the reading of the passage before taking the test. As the pre-cloze is the most common procedure, it is the one used in this study.

To construct a cloze test, the amount of time needed depends on the method chosen. One method (the one chosen for this study) is to retype the entire passage providing blank spaces in the place of the deleted

comprehension. With the cloze procedure students attempt to read passages in which words have been deleted. The student's task is to supply the missing words and the score is the number of the missing words correctly supplied. To *Schell (1972)* "In the cloze procedure words are deleted from a written passage and the student fills in the missing blanks by using clues available from the remaining context" (p. 418).

In "The International Encyclopedia of Education: Research and Studies, V.2, C." (1985) it is mentioned that the cloze was introduced in 1953 by Wilson Taylor as an objective means of assessing the readability of a text.

Taylor's original idea of the "cloze unit" was derived from the Gestalt phenomenon of "closure" which refers to the tendency of the mind to complete unfinished patterns, Taylor extended this to the completion of a written (or spoken) idea. Faced with an incomplete thought, a reader could complete it so as to make sense of that the original writer was trying to convey (p. 770).

The degree of success is used as an indication of the ease of that passage for that reader and, taken over a number of readers, an indication of readability is achieved.

Although Taylor developed the cloze procedure as a device to measure readability, two names stand out in the development of the procedure: Bromuth and Rankin. John Bromuth refined Taylor's original methods and established the reliability of the method for assessing readability and reading ability.

*Bromuth (1967)* has established "a frame of reference by determining comparable scores on cloze and multiple-choice tests" (p. 292).

their own continual progress. A student who can read a material in the foreign language and derive meaning and enjoyment from it would be expected to continue to read increasingly harder material on his/her own. For these readers monitoring reading comprehension and progress is necessary for providing instructional assistance when needed.

However, the situation is different in the case of the students who have problems with reading. To them, reading could be a painful and frustrating experience. So, much more assistance is required. There must be a need to determine a student's reading level to provide considerably more instructional help. Monitoring the student's reading comprehension and progress becomes then a prerequisite. *Guthrie et al. (1974)* highlighted this issue:

Teachers and reading specialists need a simple accurate means to monitor the progress of children during the course of a reading program. Particularly if the program emphasizes comprehension skills, the comprehension levels of an individual should be assessed regularly to supply feedback to the teacher about the effectiveness of the instructional approach. (p. 162).

There are various ways to assess the students' levels of comprehension. These include a variety of informal procedures based on the instructor's observation of a learner's reading to the very formal procedures of the standardized reading achievement tests. The informal procedures have the advantages of simplicity and the possibility of repeated application, but the informality makes their usefulness difficult to evaluate. On the other hand, the standardized tests have the obvious advantages of producing more information about what is being measured, but the disadvantage of not being appropriate for frequent repetition.

Considerable recent research has appeared on a possible additional alternative: The use of the cloze procedure for measuring reading

discrimination of phonemes and morphemes, word recognition, to the more advanced skills of reading. The comprehension of a reading material is the culmination of all these skills. According to **Johnson (1973)**, "comprehension is not a matter of separate discrete skills. It is a unified complex of skills that develop together over an extended period of time". (pp. 124-125).

To various authors, the comprehension of a reading material is broken down into various stages. **Moyle (1972)**, views it as being composed of five stages: literal, interpretive, evaluation, memorization and action.

The literal stage involves reporting only what the author says. In the interpretive stage, the reader expresses the author's meaning in his/her own words. Assessing the quality, value, and accuracy of what is said by reading "between the lines" and using past knowledge is done at the evaluation stage. Memorization of new material to add to previous knowledge is the fourth stage, and the fifth stage, action is using the newly acquired knowledge to fulfill the purpose for originally reading it. (p. 178).

**Russel (1970)** breaks comprehension up into four levels.

- (1) Word identification (reader is concerned with getting the word or phrase and is seldom able to follow the whole story);
- (2) Word recognition (Reader obtains a general impression of the paragraph, page, or passage);
- (3) Literal comprehension (Reader reads for the exact literal meanings of the material);
- (4) Interpretive comprehension (Reader goes beyond the stage of critical thinking, bringing himself into the reading to give it a new meaning). (pp.151-152).

It could be relatively easy to teach normal and advanced readers to read for comprehension. When the basic reading skills have been developed at a steady rate, the evolution to reading with comprehension would generally be continuous. Once normal readers have developed the ability to read with comprehension, they can be in a way responsible for

**THE VALIDITY OF THE CLOZE PROCEDURE IN  
MONITORING FEL STUDENT TEACHERS'  
READING COMPREHENSION  
AND IMPLICITLY**

**THEIR READING PROGRESS<sup>(\*)</sup>**

*By*

**Dr. Bahaa Ed-Din Es-Sayed En-Naggar**

*Associate Professor of Curricula & Instruction Faculty of  
Education, Zagazig University*

**ABSTRACT**

The purpose of the study was to investigate how far the cloze procedure was valid in monitoring EFL student teacher's reading comprehension and implicitly their reading progress. Five hundred student teachers participated in the experimental work. The validity of the cloze tests had to be checked in correlation to a commonly used technique; a passage followed by some questions. As reading comprehension depends mainly on a student's reading progress which by turn has to do with his/her reading preference, the students' reading preferences and how far the students regarded themselves as good readers have also been investigated. Sex has been included as one of the study variables. For this study five instruments were designed including two cloze tests, two regular reading comprehension tests and a "student as a reader self-rating form". To set the study variables to investigation six hypotheses have been formulated. All of which were found to be true except the fourth; about the role of sex, it could not be judged in the light of the findings of this study. The results were treated. Conclusions were drawn. Recommendations and suggestions for further research were included.

There are many components which comprise the ability to read and comprehend ranging from the skills of letter recognition and auditory

---

<sup>(\*)</sup> This is a reduced form.