2022

Education and identity in Israel between theory and practice

Ibtisam Sobhi Al-Badri Al-Sayed

Political science researcher

Faculty of Economics and Political Science

Cairo University

Abstract

Recently, states have witnessed a growing interest in developing education because of its importance in shaping the identity and belonging of individuals, but Israel witnesses a contradiction in this concern, which builds a new identity on the ruins of the original identity for its Arabic citizens, so, we attempts to explain the relationship between education, identity, and the philosophy of education in Israel, and the educational policies towards Arab students Israel, In the period (2000: 2019). also, the most important educational decisions and their impact on the identity of the Arab student in Israel. In addition to, the events of Sheikh Jarrah zone were the best evidence of the failure of these policies.

Keywords: Education and identity theories, Sources, and philosophy of education in Israel, Arab schools in Israel, Educational policies in Israel, Ministers of Education in Israel.

الملخص

في الآونة الأخيرة، شهدت الدول اهتمامًا متزايدًا بتطوير التعليم لأهميته في تشكيل هوية الأفراد وانتمائهم، لكن الحالة في إسرائيل تشهد تناقضًا في هذا الاهتمام، من حيث تبني هوية جديدة على أنقاض الهوية الأصلية لمواطنيها من العرب، لذلك نحاول أن نوضح العلاقة بين التعليم والهوية وفلسفه التربية في إسرائيل والسياسات التربوية تجاه الطلاب العرب في الفترة (2000: 2019). وأهم القرارات التعليمية وأثرها على هوية الطالب العربي في اسرائيل. إضافة الى احداث حي الشيخ جراح التي كانت خير دليل على فشل هذه السياسات.

الكلمات المفتاحية: نظريات التعليم والهوية، مصادر وفلسفة التعليم في إسرائيل، المدارس العربية في إسرائيل، السياسات التربوية في إسرائيل، وزراء التعليم في إسرائيل.

1-Introduction

The policy of the Ministry of Education in Israel derives its methodology and philosophy from the principles of Zionist ideology, in other words, the definition of the state of itself as a Jewish national state, so that textbooks and curriculum seek to enforce the definition of the state as a Jewish and democratic state in the mentality of the Arab student, while ignoring the specificity of the Arab-Palestinian minority, through many educational policies pursued by the state towards Arab education, which affected the outcomes of the educational process of the Arab student in Israel. Through laws, legislation, Zionist curriculum, and other racist policies since the declaration of the state.

1) **Purpose -** This paper explores the most important theories that explain the relationship between education and identity, and the public policy and ideology of the Israeli political system in managing the educational process of Arab students in Israel.

2) **Design/methodology/approach -** This paper relies on, the analysis of the most important theories that explain the relationship between education and identity and the impact of racist educational policies on the Arab pre-university curriculum in Israel. Through its philosophies, ideologies, and special values, since 2000.

3) **Findings -** The educational policy and its curricula in any society reflect its political system, the values, and cultures it adopts and seeks to establish in the state to ensure its survival and control.

4) **Social implications -** The state must make the education apparatus a device to mobilize all members of society of all sectors, without discrimination, thus stopping the hatred of the other through educational curricula and its policies.

5) **Originality and value -** Education curricula are dangerous forces that the state uses to achieve goals such as belonging and loyalty, promoting the concept of a certain identity for the individuals of the society. On the other hand, erasing and obliterating other cultures and identities in which all communities dissolve for a political, religious, or cultural purpose .... etc.

2-Previous studies

There are many Previous studies that talked about the relationship between education and identity,and The educational policies towards Arab students in Israel which we can divide it into:

1) studies which explained Theories of identity and national identity: from these important studies which relied on the analytical and descriptive method in studying these theories. These studies reached the most important statements that characterize each theory, but they were criticized in an explanation of identity, which are: (a)Social Identity Theory: The most important criticism of this theory is that it confines the formation of identity to the existence of a relationship that binds the individual to society [Abdal-Rahman,2010:26].(b) The theory of self-categorization: The most important criticism directed at the theory of self is that it is limiting how the identity of the individual is formed in the individual's classification of himself only without looking at the influence of the environment around him.(c) Intergroup Conflict Theory: which creates feelings of relative deprivation among members of less affluent groups or have a lower economic level, where it assumes that different forms of intolerance arise as a result of fear and mutual hostility [Mubarak, 2013: 79].(d) The Theory of Nature: The most important criticism directed at this theory is its racism in dividing races

149

according to their religion and their origins, which justifies many cases of occupation and extermination in the name of the higher identity [Abd al-Rahman, 2010: 29- 30].

2) studies which explained the role of education in strengthening national identity,from these important studies which relied on the analytical and descriptive method in studying these theories.These studies reached to the most important statements that characterize each theory, but they were criticized in an explanation of the role of education in strengthening national identity which are: (a) Behavioral theory: learning is tangible and observable behavior and there is no way to talk about feelings and sensations because they are not measurable [Zhou, M. Brown, D. 2015, :4-10, Jawad, 2015].(b) The Gestaltian theory (perceptual): national values are a spiritual requirement that must be satisfied. Therefore, there is a motive to learn national values [Abdul Ghafour, 2012:73-76]. (c) Constructivist (formative) learning theory: Learning is the result of the mutual interaction between the individual and the environment, where knowledge is formed and built thanks to the activity of the self and because of this activity on the surrounding community[Abdul Rahman, 2010: 35].(d) Social constructive theory: Learning according to this theory is not achieved by the self alone and does not exist within it, but rather the knowledge, skills, abilities, and experiences are found in the external environment[Zhou, M. Brown, D. 2015:30-35].

Perhaps this quick presentation of those theoretical analyzes mentioned in previous studies may helpTo understand the existing form of relations between Policies of the Ministers of Education towards Arab educational curricula. according to the policies of the Israeli Ministers of Education towards Arab education in Israel, was divided into the period of coexistence from (2000 to Mar 2009), and the second period rejecting

coexistence, which is from (Apr 2009 to 2019) and this is a result of the change of the governments as we will see later.

3-Theories of Interpreting the Relationship between Education and Identity

Different theories attempted to interpret the relationship between education and identity, and how they analyze the role of education as a key element in building identity. They varied into theories that explain the relationship between national identity and identity, and theories that explain the role of education in promoting national identity. We will present the most important arguments of each theory applying it to education in Israel.

(A) theories of interpreting national identity and identity, there are many individual and collective explanatory theories that have attempted to approach the subject of identity to groups relationships, from different perspectives (social, national, and subjective) as follows:

1) Social Identity Theory, is a theory formulated by Tajfel and Therese in 1981 that is concerned with analyzing the relationship between groups and the self-identity of the individual as a member of the group, thus achieving a positive social identity. The theory is based on three main ideas [Abd al-Rahman, 2010: 26]. A - The level and type of identity, which is used to describe oneself and others. B - Rebuilding the self-due to the emergence of a common national identity. C - This change helps to create the behavior of the group, as it regulates the collective actions and processes through a common social classification of the self in the face of the other. Applying to Israeli society, we find the national law, which considers Israel to be the historical home of the Jews, and the Hebrew language, the language of the state, which is the state of all Jews, and its capital are Jerusalem in its entirety.

This encourages settlement in the West Bank, making Israel obligated to protect the rights of its citizens inside and outside Israel. With the confirmation of the supremacy of the Jewish race over all other races inside Israel, and within the Jews themselves, the Western Jew prevails over the Eastern. Which threatens the Arab presence inside Israel, here this theory failed in explaining the identity within Israel in building a common national identity.

The most important criticism of this theory is that it confines the formation of identity to the existence of a relationship that binds the individual to society. This may lead to the cancellation of the individual's original identity if circumstances call him to alienate from his group. And it did not care about the roots of the individual and his original culture [McLeod, 2019].

2) The theory of self-categorization is based on a basic idea, which is "the shared identity denies the individual self". It considers that the individual's self-categorization is the result of experiences and social interactions of the socialization process. Self-categorization depends mainly on the individual's skills in understanding, analyzing, and collecting information about the environment around him or her; To simplify things regarding how the individual and the group interact. With the environment surrounding its human, social and natural elements [Zayed, 2006:26-27]. Applying to Israeli society, we find that despite the state's endeavor to fuse all groups within it, there are individual demands for each group that differ from other groups. With material and moral advantages, such as the Jewish student. Fusion does not lead to homogeneity and harmony but leads to an awareness of the social, political, and economic differences that were deprived of it because of his Arab-Palestinian identity.

In this case, this theory failed in explaining the Arab-Palestinian identity within Israeli society. The most important criticism directed at the theory of self is that it is limiting how the identity of the individual is formed in the individual's classification of himself only without looking at the influence of the environment around him, which contributes significantly to the formation of his national identity.

3) Intergroup Conflict Theory, the author of this theory is the German scientist (Ralph Dahrendorf) and it is based on the assumption that hostile feelings arise when conflict and competition occur between two groups as a result of any external factors between them. One of the most important statements of Dahrendorf's theory [Abd Al-Rahman, 2010: 27] is that every society remains permanently subject to the process of changing its identity through the elements of the social system and that every society has a social system based on the power of oppression and threats that it exercises Community members who are at the top of the social hierarchy.

One of the common points between this theory and social identity theory is the existence of distinct social groups whose members are subject to prejudice and contempt for other groups. It also agrees with social identity theory in that conflict between groups increases the emergence of a particular social identity at the expense of another social identity.

One of the most important theories that explains the conflict between groups is the theory of the conflict between rural and urban, where it assumes that different forms of intolerance arise as a result of fear and mutual hostility between rural and city residents, and This is due to the expectations they hold towards each other in urban life, which is more complex than in rural life, also the theory of relative deprivation in

Economic societies where groups differ in their level of wealth and income, which creates feelings of relative deprivation among members of less affluent groups or have a lower economic level [Mubarak, 2013: 79].

Applying to society in Israel, we find that the conflict is represented in all segments of society between the secular and the religious, between the Sephardim and the Ashkenazi, between the Arabs and other Jews, and each of them has a perception of identity, and each of them has a strategy in achieving this perception, its institutions that they use to form and maintain identity. This confirms the conflict theory is the closest to explaining the concept of identity within Israel.

The most important criticism of the theory of intergroup conflict is that it did not consider the culture of the individual and his development in forming his identity away from the prevailing stereotypes in society, which is completely different from the theory of self-categorization and justify aggression that may lead to the abolition of minority identity.

4) The Theory of Nature, in this theory, Gobineau touched upon the statement that the disparity in national identities is a result of the order of nature, that the lower races are not qualified for civilization, but were created to serve as slaves with high identities. The result that the theory led to was very dangerous, as it determined the identities of civilizations and nations, and there is no doubt that this theory has permitted various types of exploitation, occupation, and extermination, in the name of the elevation of identity that permits harm to the lower identity, and it has taken on a contemporary face is cultural racism that says that Civilizations remain stable and centered around a single core of values that do not change with changing circumstances [Abd al-Rahman, 2010: 29-30].

This theory is considered very dangerous if it is applied to society in Israel because those who will pay the price are the Arabs inside Israel, because of the inferior view of them by the Jews, and among the Jews also those who will pay the price are the Oriental Jews.

The most important criticism directed at this theory is its racism in dividing races according to their religion and their origins, which justifies many cases of occupation and extermination in the name of the higher identity, and its denial of the change that occurs in civilizations and considering that civilizations remain fixed and that there are human races with fixed characteristics and are not affected by the stages of the historical development of society.

(B) Theories that explain the role of education in strengthening national identity, many philosophical schools have been interested in how an individual acquires, learns, and strengthens national concepts. We will address the most important theories that explain education and knowledge acquisition and link them to the foundations and sources of education in Israel.

1) Behavioral theory, the theory defines learning as a process of semi-permanent change in the behavior of the individual that arises as a result of practice and appears in the change in the performance of the organism in its behavior, and that learning is a tangible and observable behavior and there is no way to talk about feelings and sensations because they are not measurable. In other words, there is no place for the so-called mental processes or processes [Zhou, M. Brown, D. 2015:4-10, Jawad, 2015].

   Learning according to (Skinner) is: (constructing behavioral responses as patterns of change in an individual's behavior that can be sustained by procedural conditioning). For Thorndike, it is an association

155

between a stimulus and the desired response (expected behavior). And the strength of learning depends on the strength of the link between the stimulus and the response. The response is proven or weakened depending on the nature of the positive or negative reward resulting from it or its performance (positive or negative reinforcement). And for (Watson) (1878-1958) all behaviors can be learned through the conditioning process, whether it is related to linguistic, emotional, or motor behavior [Jawad, 2015]. The concept of learning according to this school is a process of semi-permanent change in the behavior of the individual that arises because of practice and appears in the change of performance of the organism.

Therefore, if national concepts are supported, they will be strengthened in the future, and if they are neglected, they will decrease afterward. As the theory indicates, the concept of stimulus and response embodies an important role in this process. The behavioral theory refers to the systematic presentation of the method of learning used to provide the individual with cognitive values such as national identity, belonging, and loyalty.

Applying to Israel, one of the most important sources of education that are concerned with the behavioral aspect is the "State of Israel." Education derives its origins from the prevailing philosophy in Israeli society, as it reflects its demands and needs. Which aims at [Wafa, 2020] the formation of a unified society from the diaspora of Jews in the land of Palestine, and the building of a modern state that possesses the means of material and spiritual strength, in addition to preserving and disseminating the Jewish heritage among the Jewish youth in Israel, and transforming the State of Israel into a center of communication

among the Jews of the world Wherever they are found and the main representative of the achievements of the Jewish people.

2) The Gestaltian theory (perceptual), sees that learning is related to the object's awareness of itself, as it is considered the typical pattern of learning stemming from the realization of the reality of the field and its constituent elements, and the transition from ambiguity and lack of meaning to understanding the principles of organization and obtaining clarity and meaning.

One of the most important principles of learning in the Gestalt theory is to consider insight as to the condition for real learning, as building knowledge and acquiring skill is nothing but the direct result of realizing the situation. Understanding and realizing insight presupposes restructuring, by deconstructing it, analyzing it, and reconstructing it; The learning then is associated with the results, as Koehler calculated the results are nothing but the formulas of adjustment, modification, and evaluation necessary for learning [Zhou, M. and Brown, D. 2015:13-16]. Transfer is a condition of real learning, as the memorization and automated application of knowledge is considered passive learning; Clairvoyance is a strong internal stimulus, and external reinforcement is a negative factor: Foresight is positive interaction with a learning subject.

The Gestalt theory is different from the behavioral theory, as it indicates that an individual's ability to learn depends on [Abdul Rahman, 2010:34]: Intelligence level, age, previous experience, in addition to the need for a motive to learn, and national values are a spiritual requirement that must be satisfied. Therefore, there is a motive to learn national values, as the theory indicates. The cognitive values and contents that the individual learns through the Gestalt theory are

rooted and reinforced by understanding and not through the automatic application of laws and rules.

Applying to the case under study, one of the most important sources of education that develops thought and knowledge in the Israeli philosophy of education was the "Jewish religion." Education relied heavily on religion to form generations saturated with the teachings of the Torah and Talmud, to consolidate certain concepts in the souls of the Jewish youth. "These teachings focused on consolidating the concept of the Jewish national home in which a Jewish people live, whose spiritual, religious and national image extended throughout history." This philosophy included the following religious concepts from the teachings of the sons of Jews [Shabeer, 1987:86]. The Torah and Talmud in their Hebrew origins are the primary sources for history, geography, and national literature, and the primary content of spiritual and moral traditions. That the Jewish people are "God's chosen people", and that all civilizations and cultures are inspired by this religion and these people. Therefore, I worked to fill the school curricula with supernatural heroism and myths that were mentioned in religious books, and that God promised them to succeed them on earth. Therefore, they should reformulate the Jewish nation according to the Jewish spirit and Jewish culture inspired by the Jewish religion, and the Jews in Palestine must be grouped based on religion and the Hebrew language, and religious education aims to raise the child through stories from the Torah and its travels.

One of the philosophers and thinkers said," If individuals do not absorb the national culture, the nation's growth will stop, and if these capabilities are not used in the service of developing the national culture sufficiently, the upbringing of young children will become

narrow and its impact on individuals will gradually diminish ". (Sariyah, 1974: 32).

3) Constructivist (formative) learning theory, was developed by "Jean Biagi", who tried, based on his distinguished studies in the "developmental child" psychology, to provide us with several scientific and modern cognitive principles and concepts that developed educational practice, the most important of which is that it places growth as a determinant of learning and a condition for its occurrence among the most important principles of learning (Abdul Ghafour, 2012: 73- 76), In other words, learning is inseparable from development. Each stage has characteristics, resources, tools, and methods. The inference is a condition for building the concept, where the concept links elements and things together, and accordingly, according to Biaji, some must be adopted. The controls in providing the child with national concepts such as identity, loyalty, and belonging, and through which the learner can form concepts and control the relationships between their elements instead of receiving them through indoctrination, and the gradual acquisition of children must be given these values in a way that parallels the development of the developmental stages of the years of learning (Abdul Rahman, 2010: 35). This concept of learning is summarized as, learning is a change of knowledge rather than a change of behavior, i.e., an internal process that takes place in the mind of the individual. Learning is the result of the mutual interaction between the individual and the environment, where knowledge is formed and built thanks to the activity of the self and because of this activity on the surrounding community.

Applying to Israel, one of the most important sources of education in Israel that was concerned with knowledge was the "Zionist

movement," which was concerned first and foremost with re-educating the Jewish person, and shaping him mentally, by reviving the Hebrew culture from the linguistic, religious, and racial aspects as components that constitute the structure of Zionist thought, and the Zionist ideology in general. It formed committees, organizations, and bodies whose goal was to spread the Zionist call among the Jews in Europe. It took the form of lessons in Hebrew, in the Talmud, and Zionist political thought, succeeding in attracting thousands of Jews who were living in the ghetto in spirit and body [(Wafa,2020)]. They aimed to provoke sympathy and guilt among different peoples to help the Jews solve their problems, and to convince the Jews themselves of the need for cohesion and organization to get rid of a life of humiliation.

4) Social constructive theory is classified within the cognitive learning theories that give priority to the processes that take place within the human body such as thinking, decision-making, and problem-solving. Learning according to this theory is not achieved by the self alone and does not exist within it, but rather the knowledge, skills, abilities, and experiences are found in the external environment. The child must interact with this environment in the framework of the classroom activities [(Zhou, M. Brown, D. 2015: 30-35)]. Vygotsky emphasized that the cognitive development of children is achieved through the appropriate time for the intervention of an adult to spark the learning that the student is unable to initiate on his own, then the child can work alone by employing his gains. As for the second, it is called the moment of growth represented by the intervention of internal individual processes in the process of acquiring social and cultural categories, skills, and knowledge to internalize them [(Abdul Ghafour, 2012: 73)].

In this theory, there is a similarity with the source of education represented in Israel's reliance on "Western civilization" as a basic environment for acquiring education because it is concerned with technology and science. The first work done by Zionism when it began working in Palestine was building the Hebrew University in Jerusalem as well as building the Institute of Applied Engineering in Haifa in 1912 And great interest in industrial education to graduate skilled workers and technicians. The reason is that the Jewish Zionist leaders who are the leaders of the State of Israel, most of whom are Western Jews, were distinguished by their high cultural and social level, and their adoption of the latest Western trends in education.

5) The relationship between education and societal change: Education seeks to bring about societal change, or the school does not operate in isolation from society, but rather forms "a living, developing part of it" [(Nasser,1996:71)]. This is what Durkheim said, where He showed that the school is the main social institution that makes up future generations and that it expresses the requirements of society and earns it the system of values. It is the one that achieves the transition from family values to the values of civil society, where education is a cornerstone of it [(Gurova 1984: 120)].

Social change "means the study of the transformation or modification that takes place in the nature, content, and structure of groups and the system, as well as in the relations between individuals and groups, as well as those changes that occur in institutions or organizations or social roles" [(Tabbal, 2012:408)]. All related, related, and derived concepts have been linked to it, to enable us to understand more about the concept of social change, because they are similar terms to it, even if they differ in content such as social progress, social development,

underdevelopment, modernization, social development, cultural change, social becoming. (Tabbal, 2012:411).

Marx's statement about societal change stems from several hypotheses, the most important of which are (The Egyptian Institute for Studies, 2016): the task of philosophers is to change history, and that philosophers have abandoned the task of changing history, and that they have been satisfied with the task of understanding history, and that the currently required task is to change History, not understand it, and that there is a degree of inconsistency between the task of understanding history and the task of changing history, and that understanding history may hinder changing history. And that the required change of history is a clear and specific issue that requires only focus on it. It no longer requires understanding, but rather requires starting it immediately, without wasting time in understanding, and that understanding history is an outdated task, so that what is now urgently required is to change history, not understanding it, and that philosophers can change the world instead of just interpreting and understanding the world.

Applying to the case under study, we find that what Israel seeks to achieve and communicate in the minds of Arab and non-Arab students is to change history, not understand it, because if they understand history, they have lost the promised land. Instead, everything that restores history has changed through changing the names of Palestinian towns and cities, changing the names of streets and schools, and making banners and advertisements in Hebrew and not in Arabic. The Israeli education curriculum for the 1948 Palestinians is based on distorting identity, stripping them from its Arab Palestinian identity, and it is forbidden for Arab students in their schools to learn

about the Palestinian Nakba or to mention the term Nakba. They are also prohibited from studying their local, national literature, and prominent names that are absent from the education curriculum, such as Tawfiq Ziyad, Mahmoud Darwish, and Samih al-Qasim. On the other hand, the curriculum is filled with many Zionist allegations about the so-called "the righteousness of the Jews" in Palestine, and about Nazi crimes, with complete obscuration of Nazi crimes against all European peoples [Gracy, 2016].

We conclude from the foregoing that no matter how the theories changed and varied in the interpretation of the relationship between education and the building of identity, all of them emphasized the importance of science and education, which mainly helps to develop a sense of civic duty and concern for the public interest and at the same time develops personal characteristics necessary for community participation such as self-confidence, control, excellence, and eloquence to strengthen the national identity through formal or informal educational institutions, because the elements of an individual's personality are crystallized from these institutions, and Israel has taken care of educational institutions, especially Arab schools, and curricula for teaching Arab students differently due to the different purpose of establishing these institutions compared to Jewish schools.

4- Educational policy towards Arab students in Israel (2000-Jun 2019)

The educational curriculum in Arab schools is an application and embodiment of the general vision of the Israeli state/government contained in its laws, from which the general objectives of educational policies are

derived from the components of the Jewish community, trying to influence the Palestinian student's personality to form a peaceful and indifferent personality, far from the Palestinian national identity. That is, the goal - even if it is undeclared – raising a generation on a collective identity of a submissive and obedient pattern, an identity that does not possess the simplest ingredients for challenge and change, creating generations that grow up submissive and vulnerable [Nahhas, 2014: 19].

After the events of the "Al-Aqsa Gift" In 2000, The or Commission, which investigated it, pointed out the discrimination that has been practiced against the Palestinian Arab minority for a long time, especially in the allocation of land, the budgets of Arab local authorities, and the Arab education system in terms of infrastructure and employment, as well as the scarce budgets allocated to this field. One of the positive results of the committee was the abolition of the role of the Israel Security Agency (Shin Bet) in the education system, a role that the Palestinian Arab minority was complaining about.

There were numerous reports, such as the Dovrat Report, which suggested legal recognition of an educational trend for the Palestinian Arab minority, due to "the existence of a separate nationalism, language, and a distinct and separate lifestyle." On the other hand, the report refused to consider and decide on the issue of self-management of Arab education and contented itself with recommending the appointment of Arab representatives and ministerial advisors. In the Consultative Council, it does not mean, in fact, the opening of relations between the state and its Arab population, but rather institutional arrangements aimed at continuing the principle of control [Arar, 2018: 145-146].

The educational policy towards Arab students in Israel (2000 - 2019), From previous analysis we find the continued rise of Zionist

ideology in the shaping the policy of educating Arab students, in other words, schools have become "institutions of indoctrination and not education"(Leavy,2010: 6). Alexander Levy, in his study, classified the curriculum in Israel into three categories, namely (Leavy, 2010: 12-21): Either it is set according to the Zionist ideology and the confirmation of the Jewish narrative on the Promised Land, or it is set according to the policy of the ruling party that controls the general policy of the state and has an ideology that it seeks to inculcate in the young. The power of the bureaucracy works to create or significantly influence the shape of public policy.

This period will be studed by dividing it according to the policies of the ruling party mainly two periods the first is (2000: Mar 2009) and the second is from (Apr 2009 - Jun 2019) and the reason for this is that each stage had its distinctive features of statements Legislation and various attitudes towards Judaizing pre-university curricula for Arab students.

(A) Policies of the Ministers of Education towards Arab education curricula in the period from (2000 – Mar 2009). This period was characterized by the beginning of the year 2000 when the conflict flared up following the visit of the Israeli Defense Minister Ariel Sharon to the courtyard of the Al-Aqsa Mosque, which was called the Al-Aqsa Intifada. Then Barak's Jews took over after he won the elections in 2006, and the Israeli army faced failures during his reign and committed atrocities against civilians.The most important policies of the Ministers of Education in Israel during this period.

1) Yossi Sarid (June1999 - June2000) dealt extensively with the issue of the Arab-Israeli conflict and the struggle against religious coercion. On March 13, 2000, the Likud bloc proposed to withdraw confidence from the prime minister against the backdrop of Yossi Sarid's initiative to include two of the Palestinian poet Mahmoud Darwish's

poems within the scope of the literature course in Israeli schools [Knesset, 2003]. Shas succeeded in creating a governmental crisis when Sarid refused to grant his deputy from Shas powers aimed at transferring funds from the Ministry of Education to the movement's institutions. This prompted Shas to submit a motion of no-confidence in the government to the Knesset, then its ministers submitted their resignations and returned them a day later, following the resignation of Meretz ministers, including Yossi Sarid, from Barak's government.

2) Yahud Barak (Aug 2000 - Mar 2001) Barak announced the start of a secular revolution in Israel, and the reform of the educational system. And providing access to science for all, abolishing the Ministry of Religions, and teaching English and mathematics to all Israeli students, especially those who study in religious schools, and he saw that religious parties are considered a deviant of Judais [Al-Maslamani, 2013: 320]. The Haredi side declared that Barak's loss in the 2001 elections was a punishment for him because he attempted to advance a secular revolution against them.

3) -Limor Livnat (Mar 2001- Jan 2006) decided to remove the book "A World of Changes" because, from her point of view, it reflects post-Zionism. She sees that 30% of the book talks about Zionism, Israel, and the Holocaust, acknowledging that no nation studies its history from the point of view of the enemy or the point of view of the United Nations, the State of Israel is a Jewish and democratic state, and this is what should direct the perspective of the educational system, also deleted the poems of the Palestinian poet Mahmoud Darwish, which talks about Palestinian patriotism and homesickness from the curriculum [Abu Asaad, 2006:80].From 2003 to 2006, she adopted an educational policy that relies on consolidating more and more Jewish

and Zionist values, as it stated that education is rooted in the eternal values of Jewish traditions, in the Zionist and Jewish awareness, and in universal values, the book of the Torah, the Hebrew language and the history of the Jewish people, they are the cornerstone of our national identity, and they will take their place In the education of the younger generations [Abu Asba, 2006: 27]. She stated that budgets and aid for Arab schools are in return for loyalty to the state [Khawaldi, 2014: 133].

4) -Meir Sheetrit (Jan 2006 - Mar 2006) temporarily took over until Tamir took over the ministry for several years.

5) -Yuli Tamir (Mar2006 - Mar 2009) One of the most important decisions was to include the subject of the 1948 Nakba in the school curricula, to allow the students to learn about the Israeli and Palestinian positions. She believes that such a step would raise the new generation on the values of peace, coexistence, and mutual respect [Mansheh, 2013], she also called for the demarcation of the Israeli borders in schoolbooks, and that this situation is not exposed to children, but she wants to clarify the places of sovereignty with clear borders [Palestinian Documents, 2007]. Yuli Tamir said regarding the Kafr Qasim massacre, which took place in 1956, that it is time for the government of Israel to take responsibility and express its regret and apology for the massacre. The lessons learned from the massacre are taught in Arab and Jewish schools to confirm that there was no justification for the massacre.Which was a very serious accident." (Kafr Qassem, 2008). Which prompted the mayor to praise Sami Issa [Arar, 2013:12] for her service to the educational system in the Arab sector and everything she does to bridge the differences and gaps, her position on the massacre.She appointed a public committee to define the state's policy in the field of education for "common life" between

Arab and Jewish citizens of Israel. The committee focused on [Leavy, 2010:73]: Establishing a democratic basis for equality in individual rights and collective identity, in addition to gradually integrating the Arab heritage into the national curricula. She made civics a study that promoted a common life mandatory in all schools and was taught continuously from kindergarten through twelfth grade. In addition to the Jewish students studying the Arabic language and learning about the history and culture of their Arab neighbors while teaching, they will undergo extensive training to encourage the students to accept and assimilate these principles.

We conclude that this period was characterized by Zionism in educational curricula and policy, except for the period of Minister Yuli Tamir, whose period was characterized by attempts to bridge the gap and bring the Arab sector closer, but it met with strong opposition and demands for her dismissal. Netanyahu said, "This is an anti-Zionist act that harms the State of Israel. He called for Tamir's dismissal, saying: [Warrick Bender, 2007] "This is an anti-Zionist decision that erases Jewish history, blasphemes the State of Israel as a Jewish state and gives Arabs legitimacy by not recognizing the State of Israel as the state of the Jewish people." Also, Representative Ronit Tirosh from Kadima, former director-general of the Ministry of Education, joined the attackers on the education minister and said that Yuli Tamir continues to interfere with educational content, which is outside her authority. "The inclusion of the contents of teaching the Nakba since the third grade of primary school reminds us of television programs for Hamas children," she said. Representative Zvi Hendel of the National Union announced that he intends to submit a bill stating that everyone who celebrates Independence Day as a day of the Nakba will see Israel as one who gives up his right to citizenship.

We can say that this period was characterized politically by a breakthrough, especially during the tenure of Tamir, but the racist Zionist ideology prevailed in eliminating these ideas and equitable policies for the Palestinians inside Israel.

(B) Policies of the Ministers of Education towards Arab education curricula in the period (Apr 2009 - Jun 2019). This period was characterized by the emergence of the policy of rejecting coexistence led by the former Minister of Education between Arabs and Jews, as the Likud Party took over the Ministry of Education. This confirms that the education policy was the policy of the ruling party rather than an educational policy.

1) Gideon Sa'ar: (Apr 2009: Mar2013) One of the most important programs announced by him is: "Tripping the higher education budget to encourage and facilitate the enrollment of students from the Arab sector into the higher education system from 7.7 million shekels to 25 million from the beginning of 2013." [Israeli Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2012]. After amending the Education Law of 2000 and the slogan of the state's Jewishness, which was recently raised by Netanyahu in 2009, it paved the way for the plan of the Israeli Minister of Education, Gideon Sa'ar, which aims to make the goal of education to instill Zionist-Jewish values [Mustafa, 2010: 106]. This plan confirms the marginalization of the Palestinian interior and its campaign to emigrate or assimilate into Israeli society.

    Sa'ar pushed the Heritage and Culture Program for a "New Jew" [Leavy, 2010:75] for grades four through nine, which he hoped would be implemented in public schools beginning in the 2010/2011 school year, for both Jewish and Arab students where both learn the Jewish calendar, the centrality of Jerusalem to Jewish history, and the importance of the flag and the national anthem. And encourage

both groups of students to join the IDF. Thus, Sa'ar marginalized his predecessor's "Common Life" program and placed at the forefront of the Ministry of Education's goals a program that focused instead more on Israel's Jewish heritage. But this program did not reach the light. This is since taking any measures or reforms regarding education issues passes through very many stages of examination, study, and research and thus did not enter into force. In addition to the pressure of financial donors to determine the educational curricula of these educational institutions mainly, the situation has been exacerbated by the fact that the Ministry of Education is unable to provide the capital it collects for school activities. At other times, many principals did not implement reform initiatives because of their ideological opposition or concern about the objections of parents and teachers, for example, the "Ibrahim Fund Initiative" (Leavy, 2010:78).

Some principals are resisting the implementation of such an initiative that seeks to establish a spoken Arabic culture and compulsory Arabic studies in all public Jewish elementary schools. Its clear goals include reducing Arab stereotypes, promoting a commitment to tolerance and diversity, and creating common groups. While schools in the religious sector refuse to implement the ministry's curricula as long as the curricula they offer do not conflict with Israel's values as Jewish and democratic, local municipalities responded to the implementation of the Abrahamic Program. Knesset member Talab al-Sanea, while raising the issue of education in the Bedouin community, stated that the recent period has witnessed advancement and progress in the education system, particularly in the issue of building classrooms.

Among Sa'ar's most important statements: The necessity for Israeli students to know the historical roots of the Land of Israel and to make religious visits to the Ibrahimi Mosque, which the Mayor of Hebron described as a new attempt to transgress and violate the right of Islamic sancties, provocation of Muslims' feelings, and falsification of history and facts ^(Ministry of Interior and National Security, 2012). at a time when the occupation authorities prevent citizens from accessing the Ibrahimi Mosque except through security complications and electronic gates that strip the place of its religious sanctity in a clear policy aimed at keeping Palestinians away from their mosque with the aim of Judaizing it.

And about the refusal to teach the Nakba in the Israeli curriculum that it is a result of the Arabs' refusal to establish a Jewish state, and he added that the Jewish people are not occupied in the land of Israel and saying that is an attempt to deny the country's past, (Palestine Today Bulletin, 2015).

2) Shai Beron (Mar 2013 – Dec 2015) One of his most important achievements: The Minister abolished the focus of the matriculation exams starting from the 2013-2014 school year and expanded the responsibility of the Ministry of Education and expanded the educational framework in all places in the country to suit each age ^{group (Ministry of Education, 2020)}. Minister Peron announced a reform in the education system, the "Purposeful Education" program, to develop the capacity for thinking, creativity, and self-learning, to encourage personal development and social participation.

As for his position on teaching the Nakba, he thought that it is necessary to teach students the Nakba, especially in Jewish schools,

while he strongly opposed the previous position Sa'ar and considered Sa'ar to be a fundamentally wrong position, and no state can grant legitimacy to a concept that he sees as a catastrophe. While Sa'ar removed the term "Nakba" from the official education curricula in the State of Israel and opposed portraying the establishment of the state as a disaster. He supported teaching all students in Israel the subject of the Nakba. He added that he does not believe that the student who accesses education in the Israeli educational system and does not know this story, and he stated that none of the students died from education and that you learn something does not mean that you agree with it, and ignoring it does not mean that he It doesn't exist, isn't this topic in the media? And in public discourse? Can it be ignored?

He took a decision not to oblige the teaching of Arabic in the preparatory and secondary classes and described the head of the Arabic language committee in the Ministry of Education as a decision that harms the security of the state and considered that the Ministry of Education is the least important body in establishing the Arabic language curriculum in Jewish schools. Thus, a curriculum began to emerge in which the Arab appears as a stranger, and the members of the intelligence service as natural partners, and this is one of the reasons that in the Jewish education system, the Arabs do not set the Arabic curriculum and that for years there has been no Arab in the Arabic language committee in the ministry. This is a body composed of intelligent retirees and the goal is to prepare people for intelligence [Palestine Today Bulletin, 2015].

3) -Naftali Bennett (May 2015 – Jun 2019) led the national plan to enhance mathematics and science education, which was initiated by

the Ministry. Bennett has put the issue of value education at the top of the priority list. He planned to dye the educational space in a religious tint and to enhance the contents of the Jewish identity among students, by teaching Jewish students, especially the secular ones, the rituals of performing "Jewish prayers," in addition to teaching excerpts from "The Book of the Fathers," which includes touching on "the prophets and kings of Israel" (Palestine Today Bulletin He supports the Basic Law that considers Israel to be a Jewish state. It supports equal and full civil rights for all citizens of Israel but is against granting national rights to minorities, such as the Arabs in Israel.

Among the most important statements issued by the Israeli Minister of Education, Naftali Bennett, in 2016, is that support must be given to every school that chooses to teach the Israeli curriculum, and he said I want to help in the family process [Abu Arafa, 2017: 178].

Bennett is considered religious and a nationalist who supports the integration of approaches to a Jewish state, democracy, and the state of the Jewish people. And gradually works to prevent an uproar and opposition by the Secular to introduce these concepts, it increased his ministry from the budgets of support educational religious nature of the projects for associations outside of the machine, but it operates with the approval and authorization of the ministry, and in the forefront of the education plan «Jewish culture - Israeli» in schools [Mansour, 2018: 33].

And according to MP Juma'a Al-Zabarqa [Palestine Today, 2017]: that the Ministry of Education seeks to "Zionize the Palestinian Arab minority in Israel "by giving a place to the Zionist narrative at the expense of the Palestinian narrative in the education curricula. And

that attempts to obliterate identity and family have not remained the preserve of books Civics, history, and geography, and even more than mathematics books, with the Ministry of Education refused to include Mahmoud Darwish's poems in the school curricula and banning any talk about the history of the Arabs in Israel.

The most important feature of this period is that under Netanyahu's governments in the period (Apr 2009 - Jun 2019) three ministers in the education system from the right-wing religious movement, namely: Gideon Sa'ar, Shai Peron, and Naftali Bennett, have inserted more religious concepts of various kinds into all books. Almost, including scientific books, as well as activities of a religious nature, which promote right-wing values in the new youth.

5-Future vision

This study is considered very important for specialists in the field of educational development, and the educational institutions, because of the events of the Covid-19 pandemic, there were many issues we can study as: How can we develop online education? How successful of the online educational system in times of crisis? What are the alternatives for educational institutions if the Online educational system fails?

-At our case study "Arabs in Israel "these events increased emotions of sympathy tawdries their brothers inside Israel: How did the Covid-19 pandemic has a good effect on the Arab educational system in Israel, and made it developed? How were the events of Sheikh Jarrah zone a strong motivation for those responsibles for Arab educational system from the Jews to reconsider the Arab curricula is the only way to reduce the Palestinian Arab affiliation and Palestinian identity?

6-Conclusion

The Zionist ideology was not to appear and continue except through the development of policies and laws to ensure the Jewish character of the state. All Israeli governments worked to create curricula for Arab students that highlight their view of the Arab-Israeli conflict and portray Arabs as a minority and that does not have a right, even the right to teach the literature The Palestinian people, considering that they have no civilization or history and that the Jews are the ones who brought them civilization, also refused to teach the Nakba because it means the catastrophe, and it is against the goal of establishing the national home for the Jews. Also, linking the budget to the adoption of the Israeli curriculum is unfair to Arab students, and the reason is due to the low financial allocations compared to Jewish schools, as the discrimination here is quantitative and qualitative. This is what made some Arab parents prefer to educate their children in Jewish schools to ensure their proficiency in the Hebrew language to pass the Te'udat Bagrut exam to enter the university, which has no place for the Arabic language, and to be able to join the labor market.

The researcher mentions, through her contact with some Arab parents and teachers inside Israel via the Internet, that the Corona crisis has positively affected the infrastructure of Arab schools. In the last three years, shortcomings appeared in Arab schools and their inability to meet this challenge of online education. Internet networks were improved and sites for electronic communication with Arab students similar to Jewish schools, in addition to training Arab teachers to use it and holding training courses continuously for them to facilitate communication with students.

The recent events came in the Sheikh Jarrah zone 2021, as tension escalated in the towns inhabited by Arabs and Jews in Israel, and the clashes

that took place in East Jerusalem in Haifa and Jaffa, and in the Arab city of Nazareth, and Arab protesters raised Palestinian flags and chanted slogans in support of the Palestinians who face expulsion from the Sheikh Jarrah zone. A surgeon in East Jerusalem, who has been in a legal dispute for a long time. In Jaffa, near Tel Aviv, Arab protesters clashed with the police, who fired stun grenades to disperse them [Reuters/France 24, 2021].

We conclude from the recent events in the Sheikh Jarrah zone, which proved that in despite of educational policies for   erassing thier Palestinian identity and culture,they still supporting thier Palestinian brothers in all the occupied Palestinian territories. Demonstrations denouncing the Israeli attack on the Sheikh Jarrah zone and denouncing the transfer against Arabic of Israel, which prompted voices in Israel to request a reput of the educational curricula, and a review of the Palestinian narrative in the educational curricula.

7- References

1. Abdel Ghafour, N. (2012), "Educational Frameworks for Designing E-Learning", Al-Aqsa University Journal, Volume Sixteen, Issue One, 73-76.
2. Abdel Rahman, B.H. (2010), The role of higher education in strengthening the Palestinian identity and its impact on political development from the point of view of students and workers An-Najah University as a model, a study to complete the requirements for obtaining a master's degree, (An-Najah National University: College of Graduate Studies).
3. Abu Arafa, K.A. (2017), "The Palestinian Resistance to the Israeli Occupation in Jerusalem 1987-2015", Beirut: Al-Zaytouna Center for Studies and Consultations, first edition.
4. Abu Asbeh, K. (2006), "The educational vision and strategic planning of the Arab educational system in Israel," in Rinawi, G. (ed.), "The future vision of the Palestinian Arabs in Israel," Nazareth, the National Committee of Heads of Arab Local Authorities in Israel, 27-29 Available at http:// ahl. co.il/ Public/ files/doc (accessed 15Nov.2019).
5. Abu Saad, I. (2006) Identity formation among Indigenous youth ,In Abu Saad, I . Champagne , D "Editors"," Indigenous Education and Empowerment", Uk : Altamira press, available at https://rowman.com/ISBN/9780759108943/Indigenous-Education-and-Empowerment-International-Perspectives (accessed18Feb2021).
6. Al-Madar (2010), "Al-Sanig: The Minister of Education, Gideon Sa'ar, is one of the three distinguished ministers," available at https://www.almadar.co.il/news-15,N-16228.html (accessed 12 Des 2020).

7. Al-Maslamani, A. (2013), "After Israel", Cairo, Dar Layla for printing, twelfth edition.
8. Alyan. S. (2020), "Education, Education and Scientific Research", Israel Directory, Institute for Palestine Studies, available at https://www.palestine-studies.org (accessed 19Jan.2021).
9. Arar , K.(2012) ,"Israeli Education Policy since 1948 and the State of Arab Education in Israel"، Italian Journal of Sociology of Education,113-145available at https ://www .researchgate .net (accessed13sep.2021).
10. Bandar, A. Zelinger, A. (2007), "A Storm Following the Approval of a New Educational Book for Students of the Arab Middle East on the Nakba." 7/23/2007, available at /http://www.miftah.org/arabic/Display (accessed 11sep.2021).
11. Egyptian Institute for Studies. (2016), "Theoretical Readings: Political Change - Concept and Dimensions", Egyptian Institute for Studies, available at https://eipss-eg.org › (accessed 1mar.2018).
12. Espanoli, H. (2001), "Zionist Ideology and Its Reflections in Hebrew Textbooks," Israeli Issues, (3)88- 93, available at https:// www.madarcenter.org/fil.pdf,, (accessed 9Des.2021)
13. France 24 / Reuters (2021), Israel announces the imposition of a curfew on the city of Lod, available at https://www.france24.com (accessed 12may.2021).
14. Gorova.(1984), "Introduction to Educational Sociology", Black Eyes. Nizar (translator), Damascus, Dar Damascus for Printing and Publishing.
15. Gracie, B. (2016), "The Israeli Education Curriculum: Racism for Jews and Family for Arabs," available at https://alghad.com, dated Thursday, 3Mar 2016 (accessed 12 sep.2021).
16. Ismail A. (2006), "How do textbooks portray Arabs in the Jewish education system in Israel?", Israeli Issues, No. 24, available at https://www.madarcenter.org (accessed 12sep.2021) 74-86.
17. Israeli Ministry of Foreign Affairs. (2012), data and statements available at https://mfa.gov.il/ 5/8/2012 date (accessed 31 Dec 2019).
18. Jawad, H. (2015), "Learning Theories," Alukah Network Available at https://www.alukah.net/sharia/0/93654/ (accessed28**Aug**.2021).
19. Kassem (2008), "Minister of Education Yuli Tamir: Israel must bear its responsibility and regret and apologize for the Kassem massacre," available at https://www.kufur-kassem.com/news-13,N -37935.html (accessed 28 Dec. 2019).
20. Khawally, S. Sh. (2014), "Arab students' attitudes and attitudes towards the process of educational attainment in the Negev," Jama'a Magazine, No. 8,Pp. 123-151 Available at http://lib1.qsm.ac.il/ (accessed 12 Dec.2019).
21. Leavy ,A,F.(2010) , "The Failure of Education Policy in Israel: Politics vs. Bureaucracy", College Undergraduate Research Electronic Journal, University of Pennsylvania, available at https://repository.upenn.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1136&context=curej (accessed 15 Mar.2019).
22. Mansour, J. (2018), "Religiosity in Education Curricula and Books in Israel", Al-Bireh, the Palestinian Center for Policy Research and Strategic Studies, "Massars", first edition.
23. McLeod , S. A .(2019) . Social identity theory. Simply psychology ., 24 Oct: available at: https://www.simplypsychology.org/social-identity-theory.html (accessed 10 Oct. 2020).
24. Menashe, SH. (2013), "Culture of Peace Begins with Textbooks," available on https://mfa.gov.il (accessed 28 Des 2019).

25. Ministry of Interior and National Security. (2012), "Warning from an Israeli scheme around the Ibrahimi Mosque," Gaza, Ministry of Interior and National Security, available at https: //moi. gov. ps/ home/post/24620 (accessed3May 2012)

26. Mubarak, B. p. (2013), "Intolerance and its relationship to social identity and social status among the unemployed", Al-Fath Magazine,(53) 71-117.

27. Mustafa, M. (2010), "Zionism of Education in the Palestinian Interior", in Galabini, M. (Editor), "The Palestinian Interior and the Judaism of the State", Beirut. Al-Zaytouna Center for Studies and Consultations.

28. Nahas, E.; A. (2014), "Teaching and Identity Absence, in Nahas." Nahas. NS. (Editor) "The Missing Persons": A Critical Reading of Israeli Curriculum Books in Arab Secondary Schools, Haifa, Arab Culture Association, first edition, 12-25.

29. Nasser, E. (1996), "Educational Sociology", Beirut, Al-Raed Scientific Library, second edition.

30. Palestine Bulletin today. (2015), "Jewish Schools: Teaching Arabic to Recruit Students for the Intelligence Corps", Beirut, Al-Zaytouna Center for Studies and Consultations, No. 3679 / August, available at https://www.alzaytouna.net/2015/08. (accessed 20 Des 2019).

31. Palestine Bulletin today. (2016), "Benet develops an educational plan that includes teaching lay students the rituals of performing Jewish prayers," Beirut, Al-Zaytouna Center for Studies and Consultations, Apr (3910) available at https: //www .alzaytouna .net/2016/04/ (accessed 20 Dec. 2019).

32. Palestine Bulletin today. (2017), "Al-Neeb Al-Zabarqa: The Ministry of Education Storms the Zionist Narrative in All Teaching Curricula," Issue Dec (4484) available at http://www. Alzaytouna .net/2017/ (accessed 8 **May** .2020).

33. Palestine Today Bulletin (2015). "A debate on teaching the Nakba in Israeli schools," Beirut, Al-Zaytouna Center for Studies and Consultations, Mar (3531) availableat **Error! Hyperlink reference not valid.**   (accessed 28 Dec 2019).

34. Palestinian Documents. (2007), "Document No.(208) an interview with Yuli Tamaz, the Israeli Minister of Education," available at https://books.google.co.il/books?id (accessed 28 Dec 2019).

35. Saria, p. p. (1974) "Educating the Arabs in Israel", Beirut, Palestinian Research Center.

36. Shabeer, M. p. (1987) "Our Struggle with the Jews in the Light of Legitimate Politics", Kuwait, Al-Falah Library.

37. Tabbal, L. (2012), "Social change and its role in changing social values", Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences,(8) 408-428

38. The Israeli Knesset. (2003), The Fifteenth Knesset (7 June1999 – 17 February 2003), available at: https://knesset.gov.il/2, (accessed 4 Jan 2020).

39. The Ministry of Education. (2020), "Minister of Education - Rabbi Shai Beron," available on the Ministry of Education website, http://ar.edu.gov.il/ (accessed 2 Jan 2020).

40. Wafa.(2020) "Zionist Racism and the Philosophy of Jewish Education," Palestinian National Information Center, available on http://info.wafa.ps/atemplate.aspx?id=3951(accessed 3 mar.2020)

41. Zayed, A. (2006). The psychology of intergroup relations: issues in social identity and self-categorization (Kuwait: . Alam El-Marefa magazine).

42. Zhou,M . and Brown,D.(2015) ," Educational Learning Theories", GEORGIA :GALILEO open Learning, 4-10 available at: https://oer.galileo.usg.edu/c (accessed 15 Jan. 2019).