What Business Model is Suitable for Online Arab Newspapers?

Journalists' Perspectives

Dr. Elsayed B. Darwish

Journalism and Media Professor - Cairo and Zayed University

Introduction

Since the emergence of web services, digital journalism increased its share of the global news media market substantially (Goyanes, 2015). However, the need to digitize the newsrooms, the fall of advertising revenues, the decrease in the circulation of print media, and the decline in subscription revenues have placed the media in a complex economic situation, which is further complicated by the culture of "free content". Since then, media organizations are searching for a viable business model to survive (O'Brien, *et Al., 2020*).

Academics and media practitioners have proposed several ways to help media organizations to remain in business. Most of them agree with the notion of an increased conversion from print to digital journalism in the long run (Goyanes, 2015). On the other hand, others claim that digital news products do not provide the same kind of sustainable business model as print news did (Pattabhiramaiah, *et Al.*, 2019). Most researchers suggest that media organizations have to increase their revenue in the digital segment to compensate for their losses. Others suggest that there is no perfect way to solve this industry transformation and therefore news organizations should pursue their business model innovations through trial-and-error tactics (O'Brien, *et al.*,2020).

News industry is increasingly talking about their 'business model', while they mean 'revenue model', which is only a small part of what a business model is. Of course, without the revenue model, the enterprise collapses financially but its effectiveness is based on the value delivered through the broader business model. In constructing a suitable business model for newspapers, nobody can ignore the role of journalists (Picard, 2010). Traditionally, journalists used to give up responsibility for business aspects to commercial or managerial interests. The result, however, was that strategic choices were often made out of concern for short-term gain rather than long-term sustainability of the news enterprise and the social needs of audiences and society (Picard, 2010).

To cope with the ecosystem's changes, news organizations have moved online and integrated social media features into their value proposition. Newspapers have experimented with various online revenue models (Graybeal, *et al.*, 2011), They initially took a haphazard approach to their online product, where they viewed online content as complementary to print rather than a standalone, profit-centered product (Graybeal, *et al.*, 2011). They have not been innovative when it comes to media production, business models, sources of funding, new models for content distribution (Lehtisaari *et al.*, 2018). Newspapers have failed to restructure their business models, develop new capabilities to reap the benefits of the interactions with their consumers, and to deal with social media platforms (García-Avilés, 2021; Tom Evens & Kristin Van Damme 2016). However, news organizations such as The Financial Times, The New York Times, and The Wall Street Journal are innovating novel approaches to generating revenue. But these organizations seem to be the exception rather than the norm (Goyana, 2017).

In the Arab world, most newspapers are still in the transnational period to the digital world, operate in a complex and rapidly changing mixed-media ecology, under different kinds of ownership, distribution platforms, and revenue models (Allam, & Hollifield, 2021). They did not implement any new business model yet, do not charge for content, and follow the same traditional business models. Most of them are facing several financial problems, with the lack of advertising revenues, the decrease of circulations, the migration of their readers to online sites, etc. They still depend on the governments' funding, which affect them financially and ideologically (Allam & Hollifield, 2021), and control news content and editorial decisions (Hollifield & Ann 2019).

The ongoing debate on the impacts of the digital shifts focuses on the future of Arab printed newspapers and the call to be migrated to the online platforms. Advocates of this perspective argue that it is a response to the changes in audience's habits in consuming newspapers and the decline of the governments' support. However, this debate is occurring without a clear vision of a business model that could sustain these newspapers online. In addition, migrating to the digital age comes with new challenges, and questions about to what extent are Arab media organizations able to survive in the digital world? And to what extent do their journalists have clear perceptions of their roles in this new digital world? And which business model should these organizations follow to be sustained?

In the current ecosystem, where the economic structure of traditional media has been weakened and digital media are not achieving the expected strength, it is convenient to explore the perception of professionals on the suitable business model for newspapers. Professionals are a key source to identify the changes that have taken place in journalism (García-Avilés, J., M. Prieto, F. Robles. 2018) and bring some grounding and perspective to the macro-level debate over the future of journalism (Usher, 2014). They are economic agents that take part in the social construction of the users and the advertising markets (Malcorps, 2019).

Few Arab studies have tackled the business models of newspapers before (Ghali, 2017; 2018). Arab news websites are facing the challenge to sustain revenue streams that allow for the costly endeavor of producing quality news stories while remaining editorially independent. These websites are losing ground to PR journalism and sponsored content (Zaid & Ibahrine, 2020).

The ambiguous future of Arab newspapers has impacted heavily on Arab journalists' aspirations and expectations of their profession. They have expressed their concern about the future of newspapers and their jobs (Saad, 2020). This study aims to explore the journalists' perceptions of the appropriate business models, their visions of the best ways of funding the news industry, and their expectations of the future of Arab journalism?

Arab Media System

Business models in the Arab region cannot be studied without due attention to the press systems developed by Siebert, Peterson and Schramm: authoritarian, libertarian, social responsibility and totalitarian. However, the Arab media systems do not fit completely into any of these four categories. Most of them operate under variations of the authoritarian system (Abdulla, 2016).

Rugh (2004) identifies four typologies of media in the region: (a) Mobilization media, (b) Loyalist media, (c) Diverse media, and (d) Transitional media. The mobilization press serves the governments to exercise control over the public. Rugh (1979) categorized Egypt's media as a "mobilization press". He later added the "transitional press," to which he moved Egypt, where journalism has slightly more freedom. Significant government control, however, is still prevalent. Rough's other two classifications are the "loyalist press," present in Saudi Arabia, and the United Arab Emirates, which act like the mobilization press but also have some elements of private media ownership and therefore use more persuasion techniques in laying out the regime's messages; and the "diverse press," in Lebanon, Morocco, and Kuwait, which enjoy less coercion and more private ownership and political debate. (Abdulla, 2016). However, the above-mentioned typologies were developed when states alone were able to control information. So, it needs to be revisited. Mellor (2005) criticized these categories, suggesting a theoretical framework, focusing on the role of journalists and the structure of media institutions.

Recently the Arab media have seen several changes, the digital disruption in news markets helped transform the Arab newspapers landscape into a mixed ecosystem as reflected in a combination of state and privately-owned media (Allam, & Hollifield, 2021), and increase of the online news websites (Allam, 2018). The satellite era and new social media phenomenon have reconfigured not only media-society transactions but have also forced a review of states' roles in media control. Many Arab governments have either revised their laws, relaxed some clauses or have opted not to apply them fully to some extent. The Media's response is varying country to country. Some have responded through self-censorship; some have raised crucial issues about press freedoms that remain unresolved. (Rasha, 2019).

The political and economic challenges along with the digital disruption led to a sharp hike in the cost of raw materials and the prices of all products and services including newspapers. Accordingly, this resulted in a decrease in newspaper circulation rates and advertisement revenues and shifted the focus of news organizations toward their digital content, trying to increase website traffic, and accommodate for their losses (Allam, & Hollifield, 2021). However, moving to the digital environment, still in its beginnings, most Arab newspapers publish the same printed materials, and do not gain much from digital advertising.

Despite sharing similar linguistic, cultural, and historic trajectories, socio-economic disparities are common across the Arab countries, which shape media production. There are also common features among Arab newspapers. They are facing several financial problems, with significant budget deficits, a reduced government subsidy, resources strapped, lack of advertising revenues, decrease of circulations, the migration of their readers to online news sites, etc. (Allam, & Hollifield, 2021).

Till now, they did not take any serious steps in implementing business models to adjust their situation with the digital environment. They do not charge for content yet and follow the same traditional business models. They are also experiencing significant external pressure from high levels of competition and a changing audience and advertiser market (Allam, & Hollifield, 2021). They still appear bent on promoting the main political, social, and economic programs of the regime (Hollifield, 2019). Most of them have suffered from a loss of trust and lack of diversity (Hanan, 2021), which explains why the audience is not willing to pay for online news (Darwish & Haitham, 2020).

In Egypt, Internet penetration reached 45%. It has an estimated population of 100 million, 49% of whom are under the age of 25. Young readers have increasingly drifted away from classic media (Badr, 2021). The state-owned newspapers (SON) suffer from operational losses and break-even only with the help of government subsidies. Another news organizations are privately owned, for-profit newspapers, which produce both print and online editions. They have attracted many advertisers and audiences. Their digital presence is stronger than the SONs'. Their structure is more flexible and dynamic compared to the SONs. There are also independent for-profit digital-native news organizations. They come only on the digital platform and do not have a print version (Allam & Hollifield, (2021).

The United Arab Emirates had a population of 9.94 million. There were 9.84 million internet users in January 2021. While national state media function as government communication outlets, private media operate according to commercial standards. The UAE adopts a free-market economy with credible state welfare components. As the UAE online and networked communications experience greater expansions in technological sophistication, audience consumption, and global reach, conventional media stay on the losing end of the proposition. State subsidies are keeping government print and broadcast media afloat, but the threat to the physical structures, distribution methods, and consumption patterns remains highly existential (Ayish, 2021).

The Literature Review

Reviewing the literature shows that it focused on examining payment business models, explored some case studies, the audience's willingness to pay for online news, digital newsrooms' management, etc. Few studies have explored the professionals' perspectives of newspaper business models in the digital age. No Arab studies has tackled this issue before.

Previous studies have analyzed the differences between business models with special emphasis on the viability of revenue models, and explored small payments in the newspaper industry (Graybeal and Hayes 2011) or payment intentions across channels (Chyi 2012; Goyanes,2014) or new revenue models for digital media and how they can secure funding for high-quality journalism. Particular attention has been paid to revenue models, including paywalls (Goyanes, 2015; Myllylahti, 2014), micropayments (Graybeal; Hayes, 2011), and online advertising (Evans, 2009). Recent research has also examined business models developed in several countries, the role of audience participation in business models, the use of external sources of financial aid and the role of media entrepreneurs in promoting business models (see: García-Avilés, J. A. 2021).

Little empirical studies have shed light on the willingness to pay for online newspapers (Chyi, 2012). The reports published annually by international institutions indicate that the percentage of people willing to pay is very limited (Newman, *et al*. 2020). The underlying reason why people are unwilling to pay for online news reflects its lack of value and the expansion of a culture of free information, and users reflect a growing resistance to pay for content (Marta-Lazo, Ana, and Natalia, 2017; Goyanes, 2014). In the authoritarian systems that prevail in the Arab countries, people are not willing to pay for several reasons, among them the sameness of the news in most of the outlets.

The above studies concluded the following: (1) several newspapers have failed to implement paid content models. (2) most newspapers going online have yet to find a business model with which they are completely comfortable. (3) generating multiple sources of revenue in the digital environment is more appropriate than depending to a large extent on only one (like advertising) (4) the lines between business models are fluid, until now. (O'Brien, *et al.,* 2020) (García-Avilés, 2021). (5) to create a higher value, media organizations should offer relevant content for the reader's life based on personalization, exclusivity, niche, and specialized news, customization, immediacy, documentation, focus on hyper-local coverage and take advantage of the value of the brand of the printed editions (Marta-Lazo, *et. al.,*2017; Goyanes, 2014). (6) Focusing on new revenue models and (multi-platform) distribution strategies in the newspaper industry is important than concentrating on the process of business model innovation which, only recently, has attracted research attention (Tom & Kristin , 2016).

Few studies have explored the professionals' perspectives of the newspaper business models (Gibson, 2020), in which the journalists identified the positive effects of market orientation on their newsroom in the increased amount of time to work on stories, a more thorough and strong engagement with their audience, and more overall autonomy. Journalists stated the lack of technological innovation, the lack of overall funding, and the lack of credibility as negative effects. The journalists see that their organizations do not compete in the advertising market (Ferrucci, 2018). Hanusch (2017) concluded that journalists become more consumer-oriented, producing news that people want to know, rather than people need to know. Mishra, (2016) found that the lack of a strong revenue model for journalism contributes to dampening enthusiasm about convergence among many journalists. Hendryo (2019) found a certain reluctance from journalists toward this new ecosystem.

Previous studies have also explored the role conceptions of journalists and the impacts of the market, the deteriorating of the economic conditions, and the impacts of new technologies on the journalists' roles (Hanitzsch and Vos 2017) and the journalists' role in the digital newsrooms. They concluded that the above factors change how journalists perceive their roles (Ferrucci, 2018; Valerie , Rodrigo & Avery, 2020).

Journalism studies also have explored the journalists' perceptions of the notion of success in using web analytics and metrics in measuring journalist-audience engagement (Ferrucci, 2018). It concluded that these metrics: (1) allow managers and editors to more efficiently monitor and discipline their journalists (Valerie, 2018). (2) affect the way journalists work (Bunce, 2019). However, Assmann (2019) found that journalists often view audience engagement as an exercise solely meant to generate revenue. (3) without a better understanding of what the audience means to journalists, publishers, and owners, the search for new business models will not advance (Valerie, 2018). (4) although organizational resources were more important than organization size or distribution platform in predicting investment in journalism analytics infrastructure, organizational ownership plays a bigger role (Allam, & Hollifield, 2021).

Theoretical Framework:

The revenue model focuses on an organization's revenue streams, e.g., how a company will make money, whereas a business model concerns itself with other issues such as who they're serving, how they help, and how the company can sustain its operations. A typical business model has multiple elements. For traditional media outlets, revenue streams typically encompassed advertising and consumer payment either through subscription or alternate payment methods. In short, a revenue model is just one component of a business model (Graybeal, 2017). The business model has become consolidated as a promising field to promote the value and to create, or retain, competitive advantage in the media sector (Evens; *et Al.*, 2017). However, (Foss and Saebi, 2017) concluded that "the literature is characterized by conceptual ambiguity and disconnected research efforts" (García-Avilés, 2021).

The International Center for Journalists suggests seven models that could save the future of journalism (Chinula, 2018), in addition to commercials and paywall, the most common models of news monetization: (1) sponsored content, original and authentic written material promoting or advertising a company; (2) crowdfunding, in which media organizations invite people to donate to projects; (3) signatures, which has historically been shown not to be sufficient as the only model, (4) donor financing, including philanthropic support, government funding, and corporate responsibility; (5) micropayments, which allow readers to pay low prices for a single article; (6) quality journalism, differing from "clickbait" articles aimed exclusively at increasing their audience and, consequently, advertising revenues (Moreira, , Malcorps, & Vitorino, 2019).

The recent debate about how the news industry could survive in the digital age has resulted in proposing and implementing several business models, such as the free business model; the paywall model; the subscription-based model; the freemium model; the metered model; the donor funding model; the micropayments; the crowdfunding model; and the sponsored content model (Goyanes, 2014). However, most of these models have collapsed, due to a lack of economic viability (Marta-Lazo, *et. al.,* 2017).

Media practitioners have also proposed several innovative ways to help media organizations remain profitable. Among them: adopting smart and small business models that employ low-cost digital production and distribution technologies, reducing the cost of production, and increasing revenues by focusing on users rather than advertisers. Others have advocated for reducing the focus on returning profits to investors, marketing with the help of the audience on social media, and inviting the public to pay for the content (Newman, *et al.* 2020; Breiner, J. 2017).

For offering valuable journalism, practitioners encourage employing investigative journalism methods, utilizing digital platforms to present stories directly, live and interactively and using multimedia-based journalistic topics. They encourage presenting topics with analytical, in-depth, and credible backgrounds to compete with information published by social media. However, most of Arab newspapers still experiencing these ideas, others did not employ it yet. They still are in the transitional period of the digital age (Allam & Hollifield, 2021).

An understanding of the journalists' perceptions would help Arab news organizations to offer added value to its content, and to encourage the public to pay for online news. They can develop and implement digital media products and services that respond to the adaption of business models or cutting costs. The journalists should not be seen as passively being affected, as they also have agency to influence their situation and future of journalism. The greater the knowledge of journalists' perspectives, the better the adequacy and choice of a business model and content that suit its audience, and market (European Federation of Journalists, 2019) and the best way to utilize the journalists' skills and allow them to do their new roles.

While we know that the roles of journalists are shaped, in part, by what they think audiences and industry expect from them, we do not know more about their perceptions of the future of the profession or what they consider their professional tasks to be (Hanitzsch *et al.,* 2019). We know comparatively little about what the journalists perceive of the suitable business models and the future of newspapers. The scholarship devotes limited attention to that issue.

This study seeks to explore journalists' perceptions of the appropriate business models for Arab newspapers, and their expectations for the future of Arab newspapers in the digital age.

Study Questions

The study assumes that Arab journalists have vague perceptions regarding the suitable business model for Arab newspapers. It will examine this assumption through the following questions:

1) What are journalists' perceptions of the appropriate business models for Arab journalism?
2) What are the journalists' perceptions of the most important sources of revenue that the Arab newspapers should strive to develop?
3) What are the expectations of journalists regarding the future of Arab journalism?
4) What solutions do journalists propose to help newspapers face the challenges of the digital age?

Methodology

This study uses the survey method to explore the journalists' perceptions of the challenges facing Arab journalism, appropriate business models for Arab newspapers, and their expectations for the future of Arab newspapers in the digital age. The survey was conducted with 161 individual journalists working for newspapers in the UAE (50), Egypt (90), and Saudi Arabia (21). The number of respondents is sufficient to get a clear picture of the future of business models in the Arab region. These countries were chosen based on the similarities of newspapers' business models. They are either funded and supported by the government or owned by private companies. They mainly depend on advertising and the external fund as sources of revenue. They are facing financial deficiency and a huge decrease in their circulation. Most of them have an online presence, but they did not activate the online subscription yet.

The survey had two versions: printed and online. Face-to-face and snowball techniques were used. The researcher first interviewed respondents that they knew, and the others were recruited per their recommendation. The response rate was 63 percent.

The study aimed to identify the general perceptions of journalists regarding research issues, not to identify the variation of their perceptions according to the demographic variables of these journalists. The journalists' experience was varied as well as their administrative levels. Sixty percent do not have a management role, 20 percent have a middle management role, while 20 percent have a top management role. Sixty percent were male, and 40 percent were female. All of them are working in printed newspapers. Eighty percent are working in government-run newspapers and 20 percent are working in private newspapers. This survey was conducted, between December 2019 and June 2020.

Ranking analysis for criteria

Relative index analysis was selected in this study to rank the indicators according to their relative importance. The EQ.1 is used to determine the relative index (RI): Where RI (Relative index) is used for ranking indicators (degree of importance). W is the weighting as assigned by each respondent on a scale for one to five with one implying the least and five the highest. A is the highest weight (i.e. 5 in our case) and N is the total number of the sample. Five important level are transformed from relative Index values: High (H) ($0.8 < RII \leq 1.0$) (High-Medium (H-M)($0.6 \leq RII < 0.8$), Medium (M) ($0.4 \leq RII < 0.6$), Medium-Low (M-L) ($0.2 \leq RII < 0.4$), and Low (L) ($0.0 \leq RII < 0.2$).

Some statistical methods were applied, such as factor analysis, where an exploratory analysis of the data was performed, applying Bartlett's test of sphericity and the Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin (KMO). The data matrix was explored using principal component analysis and (rotated). component matrix, with Varimax, and Eigenvalue 1.0 was applied. The phrases were loaded at a level of 0.25 or higher, taking into account that what is contained in any factor is not less than three elements, expressions, or sub-factors. After data collection, Cronbach's alpha was used to measure the internal consistency of journalists' perceptions about the conditions of the Arab press in the digital age, and its value was (.877). The value of the parameter was considered acceptable when it is equal to or greater than 0.70. To test the hypotheses, the standardized estimated coefficients, and T-values were examined.

Friedman test was used to detect differences in the journalists' perceptions of the appropriate business models. The procedure involved ranking each row perception, then considering the values of ranks by columns.

Results

Table (1) Business models suitable for newspapers in the digital age

Business models	M	T	RII	Rank	I.L
The free business models.	2.47	.646	.82	1	H
The partnership with social media model.	2.29	.653	.76	2	H_M
The donor funding model.	2.27	.675	.75	3	H_M
The conventional business models.	2.22	.748	.73	4	H_M
The "Freemium" model.	2.13	.769	.70	5	H_M
The "Metered model".	2.05	.698	.68	6	H_M
The paid content models.	1.97	.693	.65	7	H_M
The "Paywalls model".	1.78	.765	.59	8	H_M
The small payment models.	1.68	.760	.55	9	H_M
The public's financing models.	1.57	.691	.52	10	H_M

Table (1) shows the Relative Importance Index (RII) of the business models suitable for newspapers based on the journalists' perspectives along with the corresponding ranking and their importance level. Using 3 items scales, it is evident from the ranking table that one model was identified as "High" importance levels which are considered of prime importance for the selection of suitable business models for newspapers. This "High" importance indicator has a Relative Index (RII) of 0.82 and the Mean value (.52). It reveals that most journalists expect that the free business model will continue to survive. The journalists considered it as the most suitable business model for the newspapers during the digital era. On the other hand, they classified the public financing model which is based on donations and charitable contributions, as the least suitable model; the Mean value was (1.57) and the value of relative importance was (.52) with the level of importance between "High-Medium" on a three-degree scale. This shows that journalists are skeptical of the audience's role in financing new business models for newspapers.

The second-ranked models which were close to the runner-up and rated as "High-Medium" priority models by journalists were: "the partnership with social media model" with an RII value of 0.76, and Mean (2.29), then the donor funding model, with an RII value of 0.76, and the Mean (2.29), the conventional business model (advertising, circulation, and government or private's support) with an RII value of 0.75, and the Mean (2.27), then the "Freemium" model with an RII value of 0.70 and the Mean (2.13).

The third-ranked models that were close to the second and classified as "High-Medium" levels of importance by journalists were the metered model, with an RII value of

0.68, and the Mean (2.05), the paid content models, with an RII value of 0.65, and the Mean (1.97), the small payment model with an RII value of 0.55, and the Mean (1.68), then the public financing model with an RII value of 0.76, and the Mean (2.29).

The fourth-ranked models that were classified as "High-Medium" levels of importance by journalists were the paywalls model, with an RII value of 0.59), and the Mean (1.78), the small payment model with an RII value of 0.55, and the Mean (1.68), and the public financing model with an RII value of 0.52, and the Mean (1.57).

The above-listed models have determined the ranking of the suitable business models for the newspapers by journalists. It has been established based on the above analysis that all business models were ranked with "High" or "High-Medium" importance levels.

The results reveal statistically significant differences between journalists regarding their perceptions of the appropriate business model for newspapers in the digital environment, where the value of (t-test) ranged between (27.72*) and (47.92*).

The above results also indicate that the journalists believe that no single business model can help the newspapers to overcome its economic crisis and survive online. They adopt a combination of several business models. Most of them expect that the free business model will remain, due to the spread of free content culture, and the inability of most of the public to pay for online news. The journalists have less confidence in the public's willingness to support models that depend on the public's contributions and donations, due to the spread of free access to newspapers online.

The journalists show positive attitudes toward the models based on partnerships, whether with social media or governments or donors as suitable business models for newspapers. They also advocate the conventional models (advertising, circulation, and external support). The new business models based on payment and paid content did not rank high among the journalists' preferences of the business models, while they are gaining more popularity among the Western media.

Table (2) Journalists' perceptions of the appropriate sources of revenue for newspapers

Sources of Revenue	M	SD	M Rank	R
Impose fees on the public.	10.36	4.037	10.89	1
Increase the total sales and distribution.	9.13	3.789	9.65	2
Expand sponsored content	8.09	3.467	8.64	3
Increase the venture capital investments.	7.97	3.757	8.45	4
Activate the crowdsourcing and the public donations.	7.73	3.577	8.10	5

Activate the electronic subscriptions/ membership.	7.22	3.058	7.67	6
Publishing paid services	6.60	3.106	7.08	7
Seeking for grants and charitable contributions	6.48	3.719	6.95	8
Maintaining the government's support	5.65	3.236	6.17	9
Selling content for extra revenue.	4.94	3.579	5.36	10
Sponsored Advertising.	3.92	2.764	4.41	11
Increase the traditional advertisements.	3.58	3.026	4.12	12
Reliance on the electronic advertisements.	2.97	2.392	3.51	13

Table (2) reveals that journalists' ratings of suitable sources of revenue for newspapers. It has been ranked from 1 to 13. A non-parametric Friedman test of differences among repeated measures was conducted and rendered a Chi-square value of 644.35, with a df = 12, which was significant ($p<.01$). This result indicates a significant statistical difference between journalists regarding their perceptions of the sources of revenue for newspapers. Based on the rating of the Mean Ranking, the higher Mean was the journalists' choice of imposing simple fees or taxes on the public in favor of media organizations. It comes at the first rank with a Mean value of (10.89). Relying on electronic advertising came last in ranking with a Mean value of (3.51).

The second-ranking choice was increasing the newspapers' circulation, with a Mean ranking value of (9.65). The third was adapting the sponsored content option with a Mean value of (8.64). The Fourth was increasing the venture capital investment with a Mean value of (8.45). The fifth was crowdsourcing, with a Mean value of (8.10). The six were activating the electronic subscription with a Mean value of (7.67). The seventh was publishing paid services with a Mean value of (7.08). The eighth was encouraging the donors' fund with a Mean value of (6.95). The ninth was keeping the government's support with a Mean value of (6.17). The tenth was with selling content with a Mean value of (5.36). The eleventh was advocating for sponsored advertising with a Mean value of (4.41). The twelfth was increasing the traditional advertising model with a Mean value of (4.12).

The previous results indicate that the journalists adopt a combination of several sources of revenue to help the newspapers survive in the digital age. They suggest that the newspapers should depend on the audience, newspapers' circulation, paid content, venture capital investments, crowdsourcing, and electronic subscriptions. The journalists prefer the sources of revenue derived from the audience than advertising revenue or the governments' fund to help the newspapers overcome their economic crisis.

The journalists also support imposing simple taxes on the public for the benefit of media organizations and calling for boosting the newspapers' circulation, which means that the journalists perceive the audience as the main revenue source. The last three sources ranked by the journalists were: depending on advertising' revenue either through the sponsored partners, or traditional advertising or the electronic advertising, which indicate that journalists do not perceive the advertising as a reliable revenue source.

The results also show that while the sponsored content, the venture capital investments, the crowdsourcing, and the electronic subscriptions were highly preferred by journalists as proposed sources of revenue, the government support-based model, and selling of the content model did not gain high priority among the journalists' choices.

Table (3) Journalists' expectations of the future of Newspapers

Journalists' expectations	M	T	RII	I.L	
Several newspapers will disappear in the near future	3.92	47.55	.78	H_M	Negative expectations
Market forces will not succeed in being a substitute.	3.50	36.63	.70	H_M	
Paying for online news will not work.	3.33	40.60	.67	H_M	
No easily changes will occur in the sources of newspaper revenues.	3.23	35.61	.65	H_M	
Fake news will lead to alterative reliable news sources.	3.98	46.40	.80	H	Positive expectations
The rate of paid electronic subscription will increase.	3.43	42.82	.69	H_M	
The public can pay only for quality services of online news.	3.41	42.65	.68	H_M	
The instability prevailing in the world is in favor of the survival of the newspapers.	3.35	35.72	.67	H_M	
The spread of online shopping will pave the way for paying for online news	3.33	41.85	.67	H_M	
The spread of paying for entertainment services will pave the way for paying for online news.	3.27	40.55	.65	H_M	

Table (3) shows the Relative Importance Index (RII) of the journalists' expectations of the future of Arab newspapers along with the corresponding ranking and their importance level. Using 5 items scales, it is evident from the ranking table that four negative expectations were identified as "High- Medium" importance levels. These expectations have a Relative Index (RII) in the range of (0.78–0.65) and the Mean value of (3.92-

3.23). It reveals that most journalists expect that several newspapers will disappear in the near future with an RII value of 0.78, and the Mean (3.92), followed by their expectation that the market forces will not succeed to substitute the government or the private sector's support for news organizations with an RII value of 0.78, and a Mean (3.92). In the third rank, they expected that the idea of paying for online news will not work, with an RII value of 0.67, and a Mean of (3.33), followed by their expectation that the sources of newspapers' revenues will continue, without substantial change in the near future, with an RII value of 0.65, and a Mean (3.23).

Regarding the positive expectations, the journalists expect that the spread of the fake news will lead to more demand of alternative reliable news sources. This expectation was the only one identified as "High" importance level. It has a Relative Index (RII) of (0.80). Five other expectations were recorded as "High- Medium" importance levels. These expectations have a Relative Index (RII) in the range of (0.69–0.65) and the Mean value of (3.43-3.27). At the forefront of them, the journalists expect that in the coming years, the rate of paid electronic subscriptions will increase, and it will be an additional source of newspapers' revenues. In the short term, the journalists expect that the public can pay for quality services of online news. They also expect that the newspapers will survive and the idea of paying for online news will succeed due to the instability surrounding the world, the development of the markets, the spread of online shopping, and the spread of paying for entertainment services.

The table reveals a statistically significant difference among journalists regarding their expectations of the future of newspapers in the digital age, where the value of (t-test) ranged between (35.61 *) and (47.55 *). The significant significance was less than ($p<.05$).

The previous results indicate that journalists 'expectations for the future of Arab newspapers, ranged from negative to positive. They have positive attitudes towards the audience's demand for alternative sources of news rather than social media. They also expect that in the coming years, the rate of paid electronic subscriptions will increase, the public willingness to pay for the quality services of online news will also increase. They expect that several factors will pave the way for paying for online news such as the instability prevailing in the world, the development of the markets, the spread of online shopping, and the expansion of paying for entertainment services. However, they also expect that several newspapers will disappear in the near future, market forces will not succeed in being a substitute for the (governmental and private sector's support) for news organizations, the idea of paying for online news will not come to fruition, and no significant changes in the sources of newspaper revenues will occur soon.

Table (4) Journalists' proposals for newspapers to overcome the digital age's challenges

Proposals	M	1	2	3	4	5	=M	T
Enhancing the reputation of the newspapers.	4.13	.734	.006	.086	.137	-.077	**19.71**	**71.45**
Boosting the online presence and the newspapers circulation.	4.13	.634	.094	.363	.096	.078		
Reducing the sums of payment for online news	3.90	.717	.004	.018	.105	.177		
Offering professional and in-depth news coverage.	3.94	.544	.315	.372	.116	.021		
Providing safe and secure paying for online news.	3.59	.625	.138	-.118	.289	.142		
Utilizing paid content.	3.56	.541	.336	-.004	.270	.156	**16.30**	**70.67**
Utilizing digital, visual and video materials.	4.32	.047	.727	.147	.000	.097		
Adapting digital editing, management, and production.	4.20	-.168	.648	.034	.074	.325		
Offering new services to youths.	4.13	.232	.688	.176	.213	-.092		
offering customized payment based on users' needs.	3.93	.717	.004	.018	.105	.177	**12.63**	**79.47**
Performing digital administrative reforms.	4.42	.041	.192	.798	.077	.085		
Having qualified journalists to work for various digital portals.	4.41	.152	.091	.723	-.040	.184		

Restructuring the news concept and content.	4.9	.006	.018	.639	.312	-.057	**11.22**	**56.88**
Launching digital community projects and campaigns.	3.61	.247	.188	.083	.587	.396		
Convincing users to pay for news, as they pay for entertainment.	3.53	.422	.027	.195	.683	.175		
Adapting a unified payment model for online news.	3.47	.342	.256	.031	.728	-.037	**15.85**	**72.03**
Improving journalists' digital skills	4.13	.537	.181	.135	-.112	-.091		
Stability of the political surrounding.	3.95	.775	.053	.033	-.021	.238		

Using factor analysis, five factors were extracted from the journalists' proposals as solutions that could help Arab newspapers to overcome their crisis and pave the way for their transformations into the digital age. The value of the KMO test (.764) and Bartlett's test for sphericity (1960.5) were at a significant level of p = 0.01. A principal component analysis extraction method and a Varimax with Kaiser normalization rotation method were used. Rotation converged in 5 iterations.

Table (4) reveals that items1–5 represent the first factor (the foundations of the business model) had the following results: variance: 22.5%, eigenvalue: 7.67, Mean: 19.7, and SD = 3.45 and t= 71.4. Items 6–9 represent the second factor (aspects of the digital transformation) had the following results: variance: 30.2%, eigenvalue: 2.6, Mean: 16.3, and SD = 2.8 and t=70.6. Items 10–12 represent the third factor (the needed qualifications of the journalists, and administration for digital transformation) had the following results: variance: 36.1%, eigenvalue: 1.9, Mean: 12.6, and SD = 1.9 and t= 79.4. Items 13–15 represent the fourth factor (the editorial and promotional tasks required for the new business model) had the following results: variance: 41.4%, eigenvalue: 1.8, Mean: 11.2, and SD = 2.48 and t=. 56.8. Finally, items (16-18) represent the fifth factor (the unified, competent and stable business model) had the following results: variance: 50.4%, eigenvalue: 1.5, Mean: 15.8, SD = 2.76 and t= 72.0.

The results demonstrate that five factors describe the various proposals offered by journalists to overcome the newspapers' crisis. Out of 34 proposals, 18 items were classified into five factors, the other 16 items were excluded. It did not contain 3 elements.

These factors could be classified according to their relative importance level as follows:

The first factor represents the foundations of the business model that must be adopted by newspapers. It includes five items (1-5). It stipulates that the newspapers should enhance their reputation, have an online presence with the continuation of the newspaper's traditional circulation, reducing the required amount of payments for subscriptions, offer professional, and in-depth news coverage, and reducing the audience's fear of paying online.

The second factor represents the aspects of the digital transformation and includes four items (6-9): utilizing paid content features, using digital, visual materials to attract a new audience, adapting full digital transformation (editing, management, and production), and offering new services to attract youths.

The third factor includes three items (10-12). It represents the need for qualified journalists to work for various digital platforms, implementing the administration reforms, and offering customized business models based on the users' needs.

The fourth factor includes three items (13-15). It calls for adopting a new vision to perform the editorial and promotional duties. The journalists call for reconstructing the news concept and content, launching digital community projects to motivate the audience to pay, and promoting the idea of paying for news among the public, as they pay for entertainment services.

The fifth factor includes three items (16-18). It requires a unified, competent, and stable business model, having competent journalists, and empowering the business model to function in stable political surroundings.

The above table also reveals that the journalists have positive attitudes toward all the statements that constitute the five proposed solutions to overcome the Arab newspapers' crises. The Mean ranged between (3.47 and 4.42) and their relative importance ranged between .69 and up. 87, with the level of importance dominated by the high importance, while others ranged between medium and high. The journalists advocate for the newspapers' digital transformation in all fields, calling for enhancing the digital skills of journalists, implementing the digital delivery of the content, offering unified, customized, and affordable business model, and reinventing the concept of news to cope with the aspirations of the new generations.

Findings

The study aimed to explore the journalists' perspectives on ways to refinance Arab newspapers' production and face the digital transformation challenges. The study found that Arab journalists have an ambiguous perception of the appropriate business models for newspapers in the digital age.

The journalists ranking of the sources of revenue that newspapers can rely on are not well-suited with the appropriate business models for the digital environment, which could be explained by a lack of knowledge of business models. Most of the journalists' experiences are derived from working under the conventional models. They do not trust public funding as a successful model and expect the continuity of the free model, which is consistent with the study of Marta-Lazo, et. al., (2017).

The journalists still endorse the conventional business model, which depends on advertising, circulation, and external support. These types of models are difficult to be implemented in the digital era, with the decline of advertising revenue, the unwillingness of the governments to continue subsiding these newspapers, and the growing fall of the newspaper's circulation. The journalists have some certain reluctance toward the new ecosystem, which is consistent with (Hendryo, 2019) study.

While the journalists are aware that the public's inability to pay and social media are the biggest challenges the newspapers are facing, they consider them the most important factors that could help the newspapers to survive online, which is not a realistic option.

The journalists' preferences of the business models were contradicted; while the newspapers are having a huge decline in their circulation, the journalists are calling for boosting it. While they are calling for adapting the public and donors' funding model, they believe that the free business model will remain; while they advocate for a new business model, they still support the conventional business model. They believe that no single business model could sustain the newspapers. They expect that paying for an online news model will not succeed with the spread of the free content model Generating multiple sources of revenue is more appropriate than depending to a large extent on only one (like advertising) (O'Brien, *et al.*, 2020) or adopting the old model.

The journalists perceive the audience represents the most important factor that can help the newspapers to overcome its economic crisis. They have less confidence in advertising as a revenue source. Some of the journalists' proposals are not realistic, such as calling for imposing taxes on the public for the benefit of media organizations. Assmann (2019) found that journalists often view audience engagement as an exercise solely meant to generate revenue. However, it is difficult to implement such an idea which adds an extra financial burden to the public. Supporting newspapers should be based on the public's willingness and their understanding of the role of the newspapers in society.

The study also found that the new business models based on paying and paid content did not rank high among the journalists' preferences, yet, they suggest combinations of models that depend on the audience's support, newspapers' circulation, paid content, venture capital investments, crowdsourcing, and electronic subscriptions, which is consistent with (Malcorps, 2019) conclusion that print industry, and news websites opt for "a mixed user payment/advertising revenue model" in response to loss in advertising revenue and the tensions between "print versus digital channel interests, and advertising versus user market interests". However, most of the newspapers are having problems implementing these models and did not find yet a business model with which they are completely comfortable (Chyi 2012; Goyanes,2014), and generate reliable revenue streams (Goyanes, 2014). Recent studies showed that there is no perfect way to solve this industry transformation and therefore news organizations should pursue their business model innovations through trial-and-error tactics (O'Brien, *et al.*2020). There is no single model.

The journalists showed positive attitudes toward business models that are based on partnerships, whether with social media or governments, or donors. However, these perceptions might be irrelevant, due to the reluctance of social media to pay in return for its use of newspapers' content, and the hesitation of the governments to continue to subsidize these newspapers. They are still calling for the continuation of the government's support. However, newspapers should have their self-financing model to preserve their editorial dependence.

The Journalists do not prefer depending on advertising revenue either through the sponsored partners, or the conventional and electronic advertising, which is consistent with (Ferrucci, 2018)' study. Although advertising will likely maintain a role in revenue generation, venture capital investments, the crowdsourcing, and electronic subscriptions were highly preferred by journalists as sources of revenue. However, effective paid models must be added to the mix (Graybeal, *et al.,* 2011).

The content selling model did not gain priority among the journalists' choices, which reflects their awareness of its effects on the quality of journalism. Zaid & Ibahrine (2020) found that news websites in Arab countries are losing ground to PR journalism and sponsored content.

The study also found that the journalists 'expectations of the future of Arab newspapers, ranged from negative to positive. They expect that the audience's demand for alternative news sources rather than social media, the rate of paid electronic subscriptions will increase. They also expect that the public will be willing to pay for the quality services of online news, which is consistent some Arab media experts' perspective's that not only do Arabs read, but they are also willing to pay for quality content (Arab news, 2021).

The journalists also expect that several factors will pave the way for a new business model such as the instability prevailing in the world, the development of markets and the spread of online shopping, and the expansion of paying for entertainment services. However, they also expect that several newspapers will disappear soon, the failure of market forces to substitute the governments and the private sector's support of news organizations, the less workability of the idea of paying for online news, and non-change in the sources of newspaper's revenues in the near future.

The journalists proposed that newspapers should construct the foundations of a new business model, by adopting a new vision for their editorial and promotional policies, having a unified, competent, and stable business model, implementing the digital transformation strategy, reconstructing the concept of news content, and offering new services for the new generations. New business models are alternative that has great potential; however, journalists must learn to adapt the new dynamics of their work practices and their expectations (Usher, 2014).

Conclusion

Taking the journalists' perspectives into account is a cornerstone of the newspapers' success in the digital environment (Perreault, & Ferrucci, 2020). The more engagement of the journalists in the decision-making of their newspapers' business model, the more they will be able to produce quality services that help these newspapers to survive online. The more the journalists' awareness of their roles and the determinants of the business model, the more the functioning and sustainability of newspapers in this new era of competition of the journalism profession. The lack of a strong revenue model for journalism contributes to dampening enthusiasm about the future of journalism among many journalists (Mishra, 2016).

Nowadays, most of Arab newspapers are struggling to survive, facing several financial problems. Most of them still depend on the governments' funding. They are facing declining in their circulation, scarcity of revenues sources and failure of the current business models which is due to the audience's reluctance to support these newspapers financially, the unwillingness of Arab governments to fund them as before (Allam & Hollifield, 2021), the lack of digital skilled journalists, the inability to be fully digitized, and the absence of a concrete vision of the suitable business models to survive online. They did not take any serious step yet in developing business models to overcome their crisis or adjust their situation with the digital environment, which could be explained by the lines between business models are fluid, until now (Chyi, 2012 & Goyanes, 2014), the dominance of the conventional model, and the lack of experiences with the new models. They are still in the transnational period to the digital world and do not charge for content yet.

Arab newspaper industry has suffered from a loss of trust due to political and financial pressures and the similarity of its content, that have shaken its credibility (Allam, 2019), and led to the unwillingness of audience to pay for its content, for the lack of value and the expansion of a culture of free content (Marta-Lazo, *et. al.*,2017; Goyanes, 2014). Only when digital media become capable of providing added value, users will be willing to pay for digital content (Marta-Lazo, *et. al.,* 2017). The practices of Arab newspapers show that they are losing ground to PR journalism and sponsored content independent (Bouziane & Mohammed (2020).

The ambiguous future of Arab newspapers has impacted heavily on the Arab journalists' aspirations and expectations of their profession. They have expressed their concern about the future of printed newspapers and their jobs (Saad, 2020). They are performing their jobs under self-censorship and lots of pressure, either from the intervention from governments in their work, or the fear of the disappearance of their newspapers (Ziani *et al.,* 2018).

Unless Arab newspapers act swiftly to cope with the changing of business models, they might not sustain for a long time. They are in greater urgency to create new revenue streams (ICFJ, 2019; Bouziane & Ibahrine, 2020).

For Arab newspapers to survive online, they should consider a new business model that derived from the online environment, diversify their revenue sources, mobilize the audience behind their cause, revise their editorial policies, recruit more qualified digital journalists and offer valuable, and attractive content for their readers. They also should consider social media as a marketing, and interactive platform to convince new customers to pay for their content, and develop new partnerships or strategic alliances with entertainment companies to create and share new complimentary services based on leisure, culture, entertainment, etc. They should offer relevant content for the reader's life based on personalization, exclusivity, niche, and specialized news, customization, immediacy, documentation, focus on hyper-local coverage, and take advantage of the value of the brand of the printed editions (Marta-Lazo, *et. al.,*2017; Goyanes, 2014). Without a better understanding of what the audience means to journalists, editors, newsroom managers, publishers, and owners, the search for new business models will not advance (Valerie, 2018). It is important to put content in front of people based on what they're looking for and make it easy to access, consume and share. Once a newspaper offers excellent content, distribution, convenience, and a seamless experience, it can put a price on the value it is offering and encourage audience to subscribe and donate. "This is the model that the study is proposing: a subscription-based ecosystem for Arabic content. The vision to "build a sustainable, defensible and growing membership-based platform is not only transformative for the industry, but it could create an industry". (Arab news, 2021). It could be done through trial-and-error tactics (O'Brien, *et al.*, 2020).

References

Abdulla, R. (2016). "Navigating the boundaries between state television and public broadcasting in pre- and post-revolution Egypt." **International Journal of Communication, 10**, 4219–4238.

A llam, R. (2019). Constructive journalism in Arab transitional democracies: Perceptions, attitudes and p erformance. **Journalism Practice, 13**(10), 1273-1293.

Allam, R., & Hollifield, A. (2021). Factors Influencing the Use of Journalism Analytics as a Management Tool in Egyptian News Organizations. **Journalism Practice**, 1-23.

Allam, Rasha. (2018). "Media Landscapes. Egypt." European Journalism Center. https://medialandscapes.org/country/egypt/education/professional-development

Arab news. (2021). The future of Arabic content is paid, says Majarra executive chairman, available at https://arab.news/p795v

Assmann, Karin. (2019). Learning to Love the Audience: How Journalists and Newsrooms Adjust to Audience Inclusion and Engagement, **PhD. Thesis,** University of Maryland. Retrieved from ProQuest.

Ayish, M. (2021). **United Arab Emirates: Media for Sustainable Development**. Arab Media Systems, Cambridge, UK: Open Book Publishers.

Badr, H. (2021). **Egypt: A Divided and Restricted Media Landscape after the Transformation**. Arab Media Systems. Cambridge, UK: Open Book Publishers.

Zaid, Bouziane & Ibahrine, Mohammed. (2020). **The impact of the platformization of Arab news websites on quality journalism.** Retrieved from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/341651948

Breiner, James (2017). **How digital media monetize their social capital**. Available at: http://newsentrepreneurs.blogspot.com/2017/01/the-hidden-power-of-social-capital-for.html

Bunce, Mel. (2019). "Management and Resistance in the Digital Newsroom." **Journalism, 20** (7):890–905.

Chyi, Iris. (2012). "Paying for What? How Much? And Why (Not)? Predictors of Paying Intent for Multiplatform Newspapers." **International Journal on Media Management 14** (3): 227–250.

Chyi, Iris. and Tenenboim, Ori. (2019). Charging more and wondering why readership declined? A longitudinal study of US newspapers' price hikes, 2008–2016**. Journalism Studies, 20**(14), pp.2113-2129.

E lsayed Bekhit Darwish and Haythem M. Younis (2020). Factors Influencing Public Attitudes toward Paid O nline Newspaper Subscriptions. **Arab Media and Society Journal, 30**, Summer/ Fall 2020.

European Federation of Journalists. (2019). Digital Journalism & New Business Models, available at: https://e uropeanjournalists.org/blog/2019/02/25/efj-study-on-new-business-models-to-promote-journalism/

Evens, Ton; Raats, Tim; Von-Rimscha, M. Bjørn (2017). "Business model innovation in news media organisations-2018 special issue of the European Media Management Association**". Journal of media business studies,** 14(3), pp. 167- 172.

Ferrucci, P. (2018). Money matters? Journalists' perception of the effects of a weak market orientation. **Convergence, 24**(4), 424-438.

Ferrucci, Patrick. (2018). "It is in the Numbers: How Market Orientation Impacts Journalists' Use of News M etrics." **Journalism: Theory, Practice, Criticism**.

Foss, Nicolai J.; Saebi, Tina (2017). "Fifteen years of research on business model innovation: How far have we come, and where should we go?". **Journal of management, 43**(1), pp. 200-227.

García-Avilés, J. A. (2021). Journalism innovation research, a diverse and flourishing field (2000-2020). **Profesional de la información (EPI)**, **30**(1).

Ghali Mehraz (2017). The impact of the new organizational environment on the agenda of management studies. **Arab Journal of Media and Communication**. Canadian- Al-Harm University, 17, pp110-155.

Ghali Mehraz, 2018. Theoretical and methodological frameworks used in the research of journalistic organizations management. **Egyptian Journal of Media Research,** 55, Cairo University, pp 4-60.

Gibson, K. (2020). Addressing Deficits: How Crowdfunded Journalists Find Success in a Restructuring Media Industry, **Doctoral dissertation**, Concordia University.

Chinula, M. (2018). **7 business models that could save the future of journalism.** International Center for Journalists. Retrieved from: https:// ijnet.org/en/story/7-business-models-could-save-future-journalism

Goyanes, M., (2015). The value of proximity: Examining the willingness to pay for online local news. **International Journal of Communication, 9**, p.18.

Goyanes, M., 2014. An empirical study of factors that influence the willingness to pay for online news. **Journalism Practice, 8**(6), pp.742-757.

Graybeal, G. (2017). Business Models for Content and Technology Plays. **Media Innovation and Entrepreneurship.**

Graybeal, Geoffrey, and Jameson Lee Hayes. (2011). "A Modified News Micropayment Model for Newspapers on the Social Web." **International Journal on Media Management**, **13** (2): 129–148.

Hanitzsch, Thomas, and Tim P. Vos. (2017). "Journalistic Roles and the Struggle over Institutional Identity: The Discursive constitution of Journalism." **Communication Theory**, **27** (2): 115–135.

Hanitzsch, Thomas, Vos, T.P., Standaert, O., Hanusch, F., Hovden, J.F., Hermans, E.A.H.M., Ramaprasad, J. and Oller Alonso, M., (2019). Role orientations: Journalists' views on their place in society. Hanitzsch, T.; Hanusch, F.; Ramaprasad, J.(ed.), Worlds of journalism: **Journalistic cultures around the world**, pp.161-198.

Hendryo André; Winques, Kérley. (2019). **Brazilian Journalism Research; Brasilia 15**(1), pp:222-243. DOI:10.25200/BJR.v15n1.2019.1087

Hollifield, Ann C. 2019. "News Media Viability." In **A Research Agenda for Media Economics,** edited by A. Albarran, 121–143. Northampton, MA: Edward Elgar Publishing.

International Center for Journalists (2019) A Study of Technology in Newsrooms. Available at: https://medium.icfj.org/a-study-of-technology-in-newsrooms-cea3252ce5df

JA García-Avilés, M Carvajal Prieto, F Arias Robles (2018): "Implementation of innovation in Spanish digital media: analysis of journalists' perceptions". **Revista Latina de Comunicación Social, 73**, pp. 369 to 384.

Malcorps, S. (2019). News website personalization: the co-creation of content, audiences and services by online journalists and marketers. **Journal of Media Business Studies**, **16**(3), 230-247.

Marta-Lazo, Carmen, Ana Segura-Anaya, and Natalia Martínez-Oliván. (2017). "Key Variables in Willingness to Pay for Online News Content: The Professionals' Perspective." **Revista Latina de Comunicación Social 72**, 185–165. DOI: 10.4185/RLCS-2017-1159

Mellor, N. (2005). **The making of Arab news**. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield.

Mishra, S., (2016). Media convergence: Indian journalists' perceptions of its challenges and implications. **Convergence, 22**(1), pp.102-112.

Mohammed Saad. (2020) between the minister and newspapers, available at: https://rb.gy/0dmoxr. Retrieved 31 August .

Moreira, D. A., Malcorps, S., & Vitorino, M. M. (2019). When journalists and marketers negotiate: A competency-based analysis of negotiation processes in Brazilian and Belgian media organizations. **Brazilian journalism research, 15**(2), 310.

Newman, N., *et al.* (2020). "Digital news report 2020." Oxford: Reuters Institute. Retrieved from: http://www.

digitalnewsreport.org

O'Brien, D., Wellbrock, C.M. and Kleer, N., (2020). Content for Free? Drivers of Past Payment, Paying Intent and Willingness to Pay for Digital Journalism–A Systematic Literature Review. **Digital Journalism**, pp.1-30.

Pattabhiramaiah, Adithya, S. Sriram, and Puneet Manchanda. "Paywalls: Monetizing online content." **Journal of Marketing 83**, **2** (2019): 19-36.

Perreault, G. P., & Ferrucci, P. (2020). What Is Digital Journalism? Defining the Practice and Role of the Digital Journalist. **Digital Journalism, 8**(10), 1298-1316.

Picard, R.G., (2010). A business perspective on challenges facing journalism. **The changing business of journalism and its implications for democracy**, pp.17-24.

Rugh, W. (1979). **The Arab press**. New York, NY: Syracuse University Press.

Rugh, W. (2004). **Arab mass media: Newspapers, radio, and television in Arab politics.** Westport, CT: Praeger.

Tom Evens & Kristin Van Damme (2016) Consumers' Willingness to Share Personal Data: Implications for Newspapers' Business Models, **International Journal on Media Management, 18**(1), 25-41.

Usher, N. (2014). Spot. us: A Case-Study of A New Business Model for News and its Implications for Journalists. **Cinergie–Il Cinema e le altre Arti, 5**, 139-145.

Valerie Belair-Gagnon, Rodrigo Zamith & Avery E. Holton (2020) Role Orientations and Audience Metrics in Newsrooms: An Examination of Journalistic Perceptions and their Drivers, **Digital Journalism, 8**(3), 347-366, DOI: 10.1080/21670811.2019.1709521

Valerie Belair-Gagnon. (2018). "News on the Fly: Journalist-Audience Online Engagement Success as a Cultural Matching Process." **Media Culture & Society 41** (6): 757–773.

*** This study funded by Zayed University**