

THE REVIVAL OF PYTHAGOREANISM IN THE SECOND-FIRST CENTURY B. C TILL THE SECOND CENTURY

Magdy El-Sayed Ahmed Kilany

We hardly find any traces of the school of Pythagoras between Aristoxenus and The first Century B.C . Since The first part of this century , however , a stream of Pythagorean pseudepigraphs burtsts forth . ⁽¹⁾ Varro always mentiond Pythagoreans , he knows Ocellus and Archytas . Cicero mentions P.Nigidius as the man who restored Pythagoreanism in Rome . ⁽²⁾

We find the oldest testimony of the revival of Pythagoreanism in Alexander Polyhistor's ⁽³⁾ account of what he found εν Πυθαγορικοῖς Ὑπομνήμασιν , preserved in Diogenes Laertius :

[Ἀρχὴν μὲν ἀπάντων μονάδα . ἐκ δὲ τῆς μονάδος ἀόριστον δυάδα ὡς ἂν ὕλην τῇ μονάδι αἰτίῳ ὄντι ὑπ-

(1) A List of writings is found in Zeller 3 , P,116 . about ninety are known to us either by fragments or by titles .

(2) Cicero , Timaeus I , : Multa sunt a nobis et in Academicis conscripta contra physicos et saepe cum P.Nigidio Carneado more et modo disputata . fuit enim vir ille cum ceteris artibus , quae quidem dignae libero essent , ornatus omnibus , tum acer investigator et diligens earum quae a natura involutae videntur ' denique sic indico post illos nobiles Pythagoreos , quorum disciplina extincta est quodam modo , cum aliquot saecula in Italia Siciliaque viguisset , hunc exstitisse qui illam renovaret .

(3) Lived in Rome between 80 - 40 B.C.

οστήναι . ἐκ δὲ τῆς μονάδος καὶ τῆς ἀορίστον δυάδος
 τοὺς ἀριθμοὺς . ἐκ δὲ τῶν ἀριθμῶν τὰ σημεῖα . ἐκ δὲ
 τούτων τὰς γραμμὰς , ἐξ ὧν τὰ ἐπίπεδα σχήματα . ἐκ δὲ
 τῶν ἐπιπέδων τὰ στερεὰ σχήματα . ἐκ δὲ τούτων τὰ
 αἰσθητὰ σώματα . ὧν καὶ τὰ στοιχεῖα εἶναι τέτταρα ,
 πῦρ , ὕδωρ , γῆν , ἀέρα . μεταβάλλειν δὲ καὶ τρέπεσθαι
 δι' ὅλων , καὶ γίνεσθαι ἐξ αὐτῶν κόσμον ἔμψυχον , νοε-
 ρόν , σφαιροειδῆ , μέσῃν περιέχοντα τὴν γῆν καὶ
 αὐτὴν σφαιροειδῆ καὶ περιοικονομένην .] (1)

The meaning of the text is as follows :

*" The principle of all things is the monad (unit) arising
 from this monad the undefined " dyad " or tow serves as ma-
 terial substratum to the monad , which is cause ; from the
 monad and the undefined dyad sping numbers from numbers
 , points , form points , lines ; from lines , plane figures ; from
 plane figures solid figures , from solid figures , sensible bod-
 ies , the elements of interchange and turn into one another
 completely , and combine to prouduce a universe animate ,
 intelligent , spherical , with the earth at its center , the earth
 itself too being spherical and inhabited round about . "*

I must make some remarks to the text quoted above :

1 - That the earliest pythagoreans were not monists , but

(1) Diog . Laert . v111 25

dualists .

2 - Aristotle says in his *Metaphysics* ⁽¹⁾ That instead the Pythagorean ἀπειρον (infinite) which is one , Plato adopted the undefined dyad . And we must infer from this that wherever the δὺας ἀόριστος (the undefined dyad) appears as a second principle , we are not really dealing with early Pythagorean doctrine .

3 - Plato , at least in his later years , called his first principle the one . He also assumed a second principle , which he called either by the Pythagorean term ἄπειρον ⁽²⁾ (infinite) or by his own denominations τὸ μέγα καὶ μικρόν (the great and the small) or aoristos duas ⁽³⁾ (undefined dyad) . This second principle , however , far from being derived directly from the One , forms the antipole of the scale of being . One wonders how Plato could have traced it back to the first principle . It seems that on this point Alexander's account Shows a later unplatonic conception .

4 - The doctrine that the elements interchange and turn into one another is stoic Heraclitism ⁽⁴⁾ We find it also in Philo who views the λόγος as mediating between the opposites . ⁽⁵⁾ The statement that the doctrine is found in the

(1) Aristotle , *Metaphysics* , A6 , 9876 - 26 f

(2) Plato , *Philebus* 24-25 .

(3) *Ibid* , 24 a - 25 b .

(4) About this stoic doctrine known as πῦρ Τεχνικόν (periodical fire) cf : *Diog. Laert .* , VII 156 and *Aetius* , *Plac . I* , 7,33 (SVF 1027) . the same term in Cicero *ignis artificios* (*Natura Deorum* , II,22 ,57

(5) *Philo* , *De Opificio Mundi* 4,16 .

Timaeus of Plato is only partly correct , for Plato says that the four elements only seemed to blend into each other , but that in fact one of them does not change into anything else .

(1)
If find it necessary to quote the following Passage concerning the doctrine of the opposite qualities and their equilibrium :

[Ἴσομοιρὰ τρεῖναι ἐν τῷ κόσμῳ φῶς καὶ σκότος , καὶ θερμὸν καὶ ψυχρὸν , καὶ ξηρὸν καὶ ὑγρὸν . ὧν κατ' ἐπικράτειαν θερμοῦ μὲν θέρος γίνεσθαι , ψυχροῦ δὲ χειμῶνα , ξηροῦ δὲ ἔαρ , καὶ ὑγροῦ φθινόπωρον . ἔάν δὲ ἰσομοιρῇ , τὰ κάλλιστα εἶναι τοῦ ἔτους , οὗ τὸ μὲν θάλλον ἔαρ ὑγιεινόν , τὸ δὲ φθίνον φθινόπωρον νοσερόν .] (2)

" Light and darkness have equal part in the universe , so have hot and cold , and dry and moist , and of these , if hot predominates , we have summer ; if cold , we have winter ; if dry , spring ; if moist , Late autumn , If all are in equilibrium , we have the best periods of the year , of which the freshness of spring constitutes the healthy season , and the decay of late autumn the unhealthy . "

(1) Plato , Timaeus 546 .

(2) Diog . Laert VIII , 26 .

Doubtless , the doctrine of the opposite qualities and their equilibrium is found in Plato . ⁽¹⁾ And so our another (Alexander Polyhistor) may have borrowed it though it goes back to Alcmaeon .

Turning to another point dealing with mortal beings and immortal beings I have to quote the following :

[τόν τε περί τήν γήν ἀέρα ἄσειστον καί νοσερόν καί τὰ ἐν αὐτῷ πάντα θνητά . τόν δέ ἄνωτάτῳ ἀεικίνητον τέειναι καί καθαρὸν καί ὑγιᾶ καί πάντα τὰ ἐν αὐτῷ ἀθάνατα καί διὰ τοῦτο θεῖα . ἥλιον τε καί σελήνην καί τοὺς ἄλλους ἀστέρας εἶναι θεοῦς . ἐπικρατεῖν γάρ τό θερμόν ἐν αὐτοῖς , ὅπερ ἔστι ζωῆς αἴτιον .] ⁽²⁾

" the air about the earth is stagnant and unwholesome and all within it is mortal ; but the uppermost air is ever moved and pure and healthy . and all within it is immortal and consequently divine . The sun , the moon , and the other stars are gods , for in them there is a preponderance of heat , and heat is the cause of life .

" what the text includes comes partly from Plato, partly from Aristotle . The aether theory as it comes here, shows Plata's view in Timaeus where the aether is not yet a fifth

(1) Plato , Symposium 186 d , 188 a - Timaeus 81 e

(2) Diog Laert VIII , 26 - 27

element , but is known as the purest air ⁽¹⁾

As to the doctrine that heat is the cause of life Aristotle supposed that the vrtal heat in ammals is something analogous to the aether , because it generates living beings ⁽²⁾

In the following Passage I turn to discuss God and man and providence .

[Καὶ ἀνθρώποις εἶναι πρὸς θεοῦς συγγένεια , κατὰ τὸ μετεχεῖν ἄνθρωπον θερμοῦ . διὸ καὶ προνοεῖσθαι τὸν θεὸν ἡμῶν , εἰμαρμένην τε τῶν ὅλων καὶ κατὰ μέρος αἰτίαν εἶναι τῆς διοικήσεως] .⁽³⁾

" Gods and men are akin , inasmuch as man partakes of heat ; therefore god takes thought for man , Fate is the cause of things being thus ordered both as a whole and separately "

Here , Alexander's Pythagoreans share Stoic pantheism their god is not transcendent , but by his reason man is of the substance of god , i.e. of the fiery pneuma that penetrates the universe . the statement that εἰμαρμενη (Fate) is the cause of things being ordered , both as a whole and in particular . indicates that for these so - called pythagoreans the relation of npovoia (providence) and εἰμαρμενη (fate) - much dis-

(1) Plato , Timaeus , 58 d

(2) Aristotle , De Caelo I , 3, 270 b 22 , also ,De generatione II , 3, 736b 33 - 737 a 6 .

(3) Diog Laert VIII - 27

cussed in the second century after christ and later by Plotinus and those who follow him-was already a problem .

The following passage from Diogenes laertius brings us back to the ancient Orphic - Pythagorean sphere :

[τὴν δ' ἀγνείαν εἶναι διὰ καθαρῶν καὶ λουτρῶν καὶ περιρραντηρίων καὶ διὰ τοῦ καθαρεύειν ἀπὸ τε κήδους καὶ λεχοῦς καὶ μιάσματος παντός καὶ ἀπεχέσθαι βρωτῶν θνησειδιῶν τε κρεῶν καὶ τριγλῶν καὶ μελανούρων καὶ ῥῶν καὶ τῶν ῥοτόκων καὶ ζῳῶν καὶ κυάμων καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ὧν παρακλύονται καὶ οἱ τὰς τελετάς ἐν ταῖς ἱεροῖς ἐπιτελοῦντες] ⁽¹⁾ .

" purification is by cleansing , baptism and lustration , and by keeping clean from all deaths and births and all pollution , and abstaining from meat and flesh of animals that have died , mullets , gurnards , eggs and egg-sprung animals , beans , and the other abstinences prescribed by those who perform mystic rites in the temples" .

I say that these things bring us back to the ancient Orphic - Pythagorean sphere , for Pythagoras and his opponents had put deep meanings and principles for purification , they also used music for the purification of (soul) (ψύχη) .

(1) Diog , Laert VIII 33 , 34

It is known that Pythagoreanism had some abstinences concerning with food , meat in particular , Pythagoreanism prohibited meat in accordance with his argument that there is a kinship between man and animal . Zeller was probably right in thinking that the doctrine expounded in the above - mentioned passage did not originate from Rome , where Nigidius Figulus is said to have first restored Pythagoreanism , but from Alexandria ⁽¹⁾ , where it is known to Arius Didymus in the first century (B.C.) ⁽²⁾ .

We have also Ocellus, whose work (περι του παντος φυσεως)(about the whole nature) is cited by Censorinus ⁽³⁾ and by Philo ⁽⁴⁾ and shows mainly peripatetic influence says in this work :

(δοκει γαρ μοι το παν ανωλεθρον ειναι και αγενητον αι το γαρ ην και εσται ει γαρ εγχρονον , Ουκ αν ετι ην . ουτως ουν ανωλεθρον τε και αγενητον το παν ⁽¹⁾

(1) Zeller , outlines of the History of Greek Philosophy p . 119 .

(2) Arius Didymus of Alexandria (65 B.C - A . D . 10) on account of his enormous industry , was the author of a Commentary on Homer , embodying the opinions of Aristarchus Zenodotus and Aristophanes of Byzantium , parts commentary on Demosthenes by Didymus has survived .

(3) Ap . Varro , De Re Rustica II 1.3 .

(4) Philo , De Aeternitate Mundi 12 .

It is known that Pythagoreanism had some abstinences concerning with food , meat in particular , Pythagoreanism prohibited meat in accordance with his argument that there is a kinship between man and animal . Zeller was probably right in thinking that the doctrine expounded in the above - mentioned passage did not originate from Rome , where Nigidius Figulus is said to have first restored Pythagoreanism , but from Alexandria ⁽¹⁾ , where it is known to Arius Didymus in the first century (B.C.) ⁽²⁾ .

We have also Ocellus, whose work (περί τοῦ παντός φύσεως) (about the whole nature) is cited by Censorinus ⁽³⁾ and by Philo ⁽⁴⁾ and shows mainly peripatetic influence says in this work :

(δοκεῖ γὰρ μοι τὸ πᾶν ἀνώλεθρον εἶναι καὶ ἀγένητον αἰεὶ το γὰρ ἦν καὶ ἔσται εἰ γὰρ ἔγχρονον , Οὐκ ἂν ἔτι ἦν . οὕτως οὖν ἀνώλεθρον τε καὶ ἀγένητον τὸ πᾶν ⁽¹⁾)

(1) Zeller , outlines of the History of Greek Philosophy p . 119 .

(2) Arius Didymus of Alexandria (65 B.C - A . D . 10) on account of his enormous industry , was the author of a Commentary on Homer , embodying the opinions of Aristarchus Zenodotus and Aristophanes of Byzantium , parts commentary on Demosthenes by Didymus has survived .

(3) Ap . Varro , De Re Rustica II 1.3 .

(4) Philo , De Aeternitate Mundi 12 .

It seems to me that the universe is imperishable and uncreated , For it had been always and will be for ever , For if it had in time , it would not be , Therefore it is imperishable and uncreated)

In Rome Quintus Sextius founded a school of philosophy which flourished under Augustus and claimed to be Pythagorean , Seneca knows the works of the elder Sextius and cites him often with great esteem ⁽²⁾ But in Seneca's days the school was almost forgotten .⁽³⁾

In the first and second century only a few Neo-Pythagoreans Moderatus of Gades lived under Nero or the Flavians .

His eleven books Πυθαγορικῶν σχολῶν (pythagorean schools) are mentioned by Eusebius ⁽⁴⁾ .

According to Porphyrius ' account he used pythagorean number theory as a means to explain Plato's metaphysical principles ⁽⁵⁾

we have another account of Moderatus ' theory by Sim-

(1) Ocellus I . 27 . 9

(2) Seneca , Epistolae , 59 , 7 also 64 , 2

(3) seneca , Naturales Quaestiones VII 32 , 2 :

Pythagorica illa invidiosa turbae schola praeceptorem non invenit ; sextiorum nova et Romani roboris secta inter initia sua , cum magno impetu coepisset , extincta est .

(4) cf . Eusebius , Praeparatio Evangelica , IV , 19 , 8

(5) Porphyrius , Vita pythag . 48 - 51

plicius who cites a passage of porphyrius' Περὶ ὕλης ⁽²⁾ pythagoreans were the first to conceive (material) as something that is distinguished by mass ὄγκω and distance διάστασει and division μερισμῶ not measurable by ordinary measures , but only capable of being defined by means of εἰδητικὰ μέτρα (formal meters) after them Plato conceived it in this way as Moderatus says :

Οὗτος γὰρ κατὰ τοὺς Πυθαγορείους τὸ μὲν πρῶτον ἐν ὑπὲρ τὸ εἶναι καὶ πᾶσαν οὐσίαν ἀποφαίνεται, τὸ δὲ δεύτερον ἐν, ὅπερ ἐστὶ τὸ ὄντως ὄν καὶ νοητόν, τὰ εἶδη φησὶν εἶναι, τὸ δὲ τρίτον, ὅπερ ἐστὶ τὸ ψυχικόν, μετέχειν τοῦ ἑνὸς καὶ τῶν εἰδῶν, τὴν δὲ ἀπὸ τούτου τελευταίαν φύσιν τῶν αἰσθητῶν οὐσαν μηδὲ μετέχειν, ἀλλὰ κατ' ἐμφασιν ἐκείνων ² κεκοσμηῆσθαι, τῆς ἐν αὐτοῖς ὕλης τοῦ μὴ ὄντος πρῶτως ἐν τῷ ποσῶ ὄντος οὐσης ³ σκίασμα καὶ ἐτι μᾶλλον ὑποβεβηκυίας καὶ ἀπὸ τούτου. καὶ ταῦτα δὲ ὁ Πορφύριος ἐν τῷ δευτέρῳ Περὶ ὕλης τὰ τοῦ Μοδεράτου παρατιθέμενος γέγραφεν ὅτι "βουλευθεὶς ὁ ἐνιαῖος λόγος, ὡς πού φησιν ὁ Πλάτων, τὴν γένεσιν ἀφ' ἑαυτοῦ τῶν ὄντων συστήσασθαι, κατὰ στέρησιν αὐτοῦ ἐχώρησε τὴν ποσότητα πάντων αὐτὴν στερήσας τῶν αὐτοῦ λόγων καὶ εἰδῶν. τοῦτο δὲ ποσότητα ἐκάλεσεν ἄμορφον καὶ ἀδιαίρετον καὶ ἀσχημάτιστον, ἐπιδεχομένην μέντοι μορφήν σχῆμα διαίρεσιν ποιότητα πᾶν τὸ τοιοῦτον. ἐπὶ ταύτης ἔοικε, φησί, τῆς ποσότητος ὁ Πλάτων τὰ πλείω ὀνόματα κατηγορῆσαι "πανδεχῆ" καὶ ἀνείδεον λέγων καὶ "ἀόρατον" καὶ "ἀπορώτατα τοῦ νοητοῦ μετεληφέναι" αὐτὴν καὶ "λογισμῶ νόθῳ μόλις ληπτὴν" καὶ πᾶν τὸ τούτοις ἐμπερές, αὐτὴ δὲ ἡ ποσότης, φησί, καὶ τοῦτο τὸ εἶδος τὸ κατὰ στέρησιν τοῦ ἐνιαῖου λόγου νοούμενον τοῦ πάντας τοὺς λόγους τῶν ὄντων ἐν ἑαυτῷ περιειληφότος παραδείγματά ἐστι τῆς τῶν σωμάτων ὕλης, ἣν καὶ αὐτὴν ποσὸν καὶ τοὺς Πυθαγορείους καὶ τὸν Πλάτωνα καλεῖν ἔλεγεν, οὐ τὸ ὡς εἶδος ποσόν, ἀλλὰ τὸ κατὰ στέρησιν καὶ παράλυσιν καὶ ἔκτασιν καὶ διασπασμὸν καὶ διὰ τὴν ἀπὸ τοῦ ὄντος παράλλαξιν, δι' ἃ καὶ κακὸν δοκεῖ ἡ ὕλη ὡς τὸ ἀγαθὸν ἀποφεύγουσα. καὶ καταλαμβάνεται ὑπ' αὐτοῦ καὶ ἐξελλεῖν τῶν ὄρων οὐ συγχωρεῖται, τῆς μὲν ἐκτάσεως τὸν τοῦ εἰδητικοῦ μεγέθους λόγον ἐπιδεχομένης καὶ τούτῳ ὀριζομένης, τοῦ δὲ διασπασμοῦ τῆ ἀριθμητικῆ διακρίσει εἰδοποιουμένου".

(1) Simplicius, physics, p 230, 41 - 231, 25

From simplicius ' account of Moderatus , doctrine we see for the first time the four stages of the Neoplatonic hierarchy of being clearly outlined .

Dodds recognized it as a Neopythagorean interpretation of Plato's Parmenides ⁽¹⁾ of which he finds an earlier trace in a correction made by the Neopythagorean Eudorus of Alexandria in a passage of Aristotle ; The text of Aristotle , Metaphysics ⁽²⁾ .

Τὰ γὰρ εἶδη τοῦ τί ἐστὶν αἴτια τοῖς ἄλλοις , τοῖς δ, εἶ-
δεσιν τὸ ἓν ⁽³⁾ . Alexander in Metaphysics says that Eudorus
and Euarmostus read : Τοῖς δ, εἶδεσιν τὸ ἓν καὶ τῆ ὕλη .
Dodds thinks there is not an omission here , but Eudorus
changed the text of Aristotle in the sense of Neopythagorean
monism which derived the (ἄπειρον) (infinite) directly
from the one .

In The Third Century Philostratus wrote a kind of saint's
life of Apollonius , as an example of the perfectus sapiens
(perfect wise man) in Pythagorean style, The story abounds
with miracles , but the author takes great pains to explain
that they are not produced by magic art but spring from a
superior wisdom and intimate connection with God (or the

(1) The Parmenides of Plato and the origin of the Neoplatonic (One)
in class , Quart 1928 p 129 - 142 .

(2) Aristotle , Metaph A 988 a 10 - 11

(3) Alexander Aphrod , Metaphysics I , 31 - 59 .

gods) ⁽¹⁾ Dio Cassius mentions Apollonius and His life of Pythagorus is cited by Porphyrius and by Iamblichus , of his books *περὶ Θεσιῶν* a fragment is preserved by Eusebius .

Nicomachus of Gerasa elaborated the early Pythagorean Theory of number as a cosmic principle .

Nicomachus says that of the mathematical sciences arithmetic is concerned with absolute quantity , music with relative quantity ; two other sciences deal with size , geometry with the part that is at rest , astronomy with that which moves , These sciences , are indispensable for the knowledge of things and a Condition of wisdom so he means that Mathematics a condition of wisdom .

Nicomachus speaks of *μονὰς ἀρσενόθηλος* as follows :

[Λέγει δέ Τήν μονάδα ἄλλα τε οὐκ ὀλίγα τῶν πλασμάτων τῇ περὶ αὐτὴν ἀληθείᾳ , καὶ τοῖς προσοῦσι φυσικοῖς ἰδιώμασι , καταυιγνύς , καὶ ὡς νοῦς τε εἶη , εἶτα καὶ ἀρσενόθηλος , καὶ θεός , καὶ ὕλη δέ πῶς , πάντα χρήματα μιγνύς ὡς ἀληθως , καὶ πανδοχεὺς λοιπὸν καὶ χωρητικὴ καὶ χάος , σύγχυσις σύγκρασις , ἀλαμπία , σκοτωδία , χάσμα , τάρταρος] .

(1) Philostratos , I 2 ; V 12 , VIII 7,9 .

That the first principle is at once $\upsilon\lambda\eta$ - not only that $\upsilon\lambda\eta$ derives from it - is not yet in Alexander polyhistor's account of Pythagorean doctrine mentioned in Diog Laert ⁽¹⁾ but it is found in the Stoa ⁽²⁾

(1) Diog, Laert., VIII 25.

(2) Stobaeus (SVF I 87):

Ζήνωνος οὐσίαν δέ εἶναι τὴν τῶν ὄντων πάντων πρώτην ὑλὴν, ταύτην δὲ πᾶσαν αἰδίων καὶ οὔτε πλείω γιγνομένων οὔτε ἐλάττω, τὰ δὲ μέρη ταύτης οὐκ αἰεὶ ταῦτά διαμένει ἀλλὰ διαίρεισθαι καὶ συγχέεισθαι. διὰ ταύτης δὲ διαθεῖν τὸν τοῦ παντός λόγον ὅν ἔνιοι εἰμαρμένην καλοῦσιν οἷον περ καὶ ἐν τῇ γονῇ τὸ σπέρμα.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Texts : Aristotle, Metaphysics (Loeb)
 : , De Caelo
 : , De Generatione
- :: Diogenes Laertius I , II (Loeb)
 :: Eusebius, Praeparatio Evangelica (Loeb)
 :: Philo , De Aeternitate Mundi
 :: Philo , De Opificio Mundi
 :: Plato , Philebus
 :: Plato , Symposium
 :: Plato , Timaeus
 :: Seneca, Epistolae Morales (Loeb)
 :: Seneca, Quaestiones Naturales (Loeb)
 :: Stobaeus, Ocellus, Porphyrius and Simplicius Ap:
 :: J.Von Arnim, Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta (Lipsiae)
 :: References /
- Zeller, Outlines of the History of Greek Philosophy,
 (Oxford 1931.)